



INTERNATIONAL
ROAD CONGRESS

Innovation in Road Infrastructure



INTERNATIONAL ROAD FEDERATION
FÉDÉRATION ROUTIÈRE INTERNATIONALE

The German PPP F-Model:

Why It Failed and What Could Be Improved

Andreas Knorr / Alexander Eisenkopf /
Rahel Schomaker / Melanie Nofz

MOSCOW, RUSSIA

22-24 NOVEMBER 2011



PPP F-Model

- Potential benefits are obvious
 - First step towards user-pays system
 - Might alleviate chronic underinvestment in road infrastructures
 - Commercial pressures might speed up project implementation

Case study I: the Warnowtunnel

- Length of tunnel
730 m
- Opened for traffic
09/2003
- Construction costs
€ 219 mio



Case study I: the Warnowtunnel

Period	Daily users (average)	Target-Performance Comparison
12 th 09 – 31 st 10/2003	6.471	-13.529
12/2003	6.151	-13.849
12/2004	7.928	-12.072
10 – 12/2005	9.190	-10.810
10 – 12/2006	9.742	-10.258
10 – 12/2007	9.897	-10.103
10 – 12/2008	10.659	-9.341
10 – 12/2009	9.617	-10.383
10 – 12/2010	10.890	-9.110

Case study II: the Herrentunnel

- Length of tunnel
830 m
- Opened for traffic
08/2005
- Construction costs
€ 179 mio





Conclusions: Why the F-Model failed

- Reality looks much bleaker
 - So far no overall cost savings
 - Massive political risks
 - Actual traffic volumes and willingness to pay were substantially overestimated
 - Tolls are fees → normal private-sector pricing models run afoul of the law
 - Strong local political resistance to toll systems prevents transition