

## SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT & INFRASTRUCTURE

---

### Making Transport Work for Women and Men Tools for Task Teams



December 2010

This paper has not undergone the review accorded to official World Bank publications. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank and its affiliated organizations, or those of the Executive Directors of The World Bank or the governments they represent.

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

To request copies of the paper or for more information on the series, please contact the Social Development Department

Social Development

The World Bank

1818 H Street, NW

Washington, DC 20433

Fax: 202-522-3247

E-mail: [socialdevelopment@worldbank.org](mailto:socialdevelopment@worldbank.org)



Printed on Recycled Paper

Copyright The World Bank 2010

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	ii
Guide for Using the Tools: .....	iii
Suggested Use of the Tools: .....	iii
Introduction: .....	1
1. Entry Points for Integrating Gender in Transport Policy Dialogue.....	6
2. Rapid Gender and Transport Review Questions.....	8
3. Key Questions during Transport Project Cycle for Integrating Gender and other Social Dimensions ...	10
4. Developing Effective Project Gender Plans/Frameworks .....	12
5. Enhancing Gender Integration in Transport Projects .....	16
6. Inclusive Involuntary Displacement and Resettlement Checklist.....	26
7. Transport Results Indicators: Gender-Responsive Examples .....	31
8. Sample Gender-Responsive Public Transportation User Survey .....	33
9. Gender-Responsive HIV/AIDS Prevention.....	37
10. Good Practice Cases.....	42
11. Gender and Transport Website Resources .....	60
12. Suggested Reading on Gender and Transport .....	62

# Acknowledgements

Mari Clarke compiled and adapted these materials from many sourcebooks, resource guides, guidelines, and other documents on gender and transport prepared by the World Bank and other international development agencies. These tools were prepared for the Social Development Department under the guidance of Nilufar Ahmad (Task Team Leader), with assistance from Caroline Mendizabal Betancourt. This work was carried out in collaboration with the Gender Focal Points of the Transport Sector. Peer reviewers for the draft tools included Julie Babinard, George Banjo, Stephen Brushett, and Jean Noel Guillosoou. Comments on the Tools were received from Nina Bhatt, Anne Kuriakose, Helle Buchhave and Florian Kitt (EASER), Yulia Immajati (EASPR), Dewayani Diah Savitri (PSF Gender Advisor, Jakarta), and Satya Mishra (SASDS). Inputs and comments on good practice case studies were provided by: Nilufar Ahmad (Bangladesh Rural Roads and Markets); Luz Caballaro (Peru Rural Roads); Satya Mishra (Mumbai Urban Urban transport); Shomik Mehndiratta and Wenling Chen (Liaoning China Medium Cities Transport).

This activity was partially financed by the Gender Action Plan.

## For Technical Advice on Gender and Transport Contact:

### **Gender Focal Points/Anchor Focal Points**

Nilufar Ahmad, Sr. Gender Specialist, Social Development Department (SDV)

Julie Babinard, Environment and Social Development Specialist, TWITR

Nishta Sinha, Economist, PREM Gender (PRMGE)

### **Transport Task Team Leaders**

George Banjo, Nicolas Peltier, *Africa and Europe and Central Asia*

Baher El Hafnawey, Shomik Mehndiratta, *East Asia and the Pacific*

Stephen Brushett, *Latin America and the Caribbean*

Jean Charles Crochet, *Middle East and North Africa*

Jean Noel Guillosoou, Simon Ellis, *South Asia*

## Guide for Using the Tools:

**Objective:** The primary objective is to provide brief, relevant, and practical tools for World Bank task teams and their country counterparts to facilitate their work in addressing gender issues in transport policies and projects. This responds to the need, expressed by task teams, to repackage and condense existing gender and transport tools in formats more relevant to transport operations. These tools can also be used for training on gender and transport. The term “tool” was selected to convey the notion that these materials are nuts and bolts resources to be used when needed; and to emphasize that they are not requirements or directives.

**Complementarity with Other Gender and Transport Resources:** These tools are intended to complement and be used in combination with the 2010 Transport Sector Paper on *Mainstreaming Gender in Road Transport, Operational Guidance for World Bank Staff*, the updated electronic *Gender and Transport Resource Guide* and the Gender and Transport Training tools developed under the *Capacity Building for Gender Mainstreaming in Transport* initiative. Together these resources offer transport task teams a wealth of resources for enhancing their projects and technical support through greater attention to gender and other social dimensions.

### Suggested Use of the Tools:

**Introduction:** (a) **Why Gender is a Transport Issue** and (b) **approaches to integrate gender in operations.**

The introduction provides (a) key gender issues and rationale for addressing gender in its broader social context in transport policies and programs; and (b) approaches to integrate gender in transport sector operations. The introduction can serve as a resource for dialogues with clients as well as transport colleagues that attention to gender can reduce risks and enhance benefits to marginalized groups and steps needed for gender integration.

**1. Entry points for Gender and Transport in Policy Dialogues.** The first tool is a checklist for entry points for mainstreaming gender and other social dimensions of transport in policy dialogue for PRSPs, Partnership Strategies, Country Assistance Strategies and Country Transport Sector Strategies. While all of the items may not apply to a given policy or strategy, they provide suggestions for key entry points and actions to take.

**2. Rapid Gender and Transport Review Questions.** The second tool provides a list of questions for task teams to consider when assessing whether and the extent to which gender, in its broader social context, is likely to be an issue in the project. Not all questions apply to all projects. If the review identifies gender-based risks, constraints or opportunities for greater development effectiveness by addressing gender, further gender analysis during the preparation phase will identify actions for reducing gender-based constraints and disparity and increasing equitable benefits.

**3. Key Questions during Transport Project Cycle for Integrating Gender and other Social Dimensions**

The third tool provides sets of questions that can be used during the transport project cycle for mainstreaming gender and other social dimensions. While all of the items may not apply to a given project, they provide suggestions for key entry points and actions to take.

**4. Developing Effective Project Gender Plans/Frameworks.** The fourth tool describes the purpose of gender plans/frameworks when gender is a significant factor that needs to be addressed in a transport project. Where the preceding checklists assess whether or not gender is an issue and flag areas needing attention, the gender plan provides a blueprint for implementing gender-targeted interventions within project components. It presents key steps for quality plan development and also provides a good practice example of a gender plan, linked to the gender-relevant transport project that can easily be adapted to other projects. The example also illustrates that these plans need not be complex to provide a valuable tool for tracking planned gender activities in a transport project.

**5. Enhancing Gender Integration in Transport Projects.**

The fifth tool is a matrix presenting some effective approaches to promote greater equality in access and benefits for all users.

**6. Inclusive Involuntary Displacement and Resettlement Checklist.**

Tool six provides a checklist of considerations so that affected women as well as men are consulted about their needs and priorities, and receive fair compensation for loss of livelihood and property.

**7. Transport Results: Examples of Gender-Responsive Indicators.**

The seventh tool provides examples of the types of gender-responsive indicators that can be used to measure progress toward reducing gender disparities and increasing gender equality. The list is illustrative not exhaustive. No project will need all of the indicators.

**8. Sample Public Transportation User Survey.**

The eighth tool is a transport user survey that captures the off-peak, trip chaining travel of women and men who carry out multiple tasks, and the travel of women and men working in the informal sector as well as travel to formal sector work. Questions can be adapted to better fit specific project objectives and address specific cultural constraints on mobility.

**9. Gender Informed HIV/AIDS Prevention.**

Tool nine provides a checklist of gender questions for HIV/AIDS prevention activities, an example of a national Transport HIV/AIDS policy, and an example of HIV/AIDS clauses for transport works contracts. A good practice case of HIV/AIDS prevention in a corridor project in West Africa is also included. These are all models that can be adapted to local circumstances.

**10. Good Practice Cases.**

The tenth tool includes two rural and two urban transport good practice cases that illustrate the use of effective approaches for mainstreaming gender and other social dimensions, and improving project effectiveness and sustainability. Additional brief case examples illustrate approaches to build capacity of client implementing agencies to address gender and other social dimensions of transport. It also includes examples of innovative projects that have integrated gender in the project design.

**11. Web-Based Resources on Gender and Transport.**

Tool eleven provides addresses for web-based networks, resources, and initiatives on gender and transport. This list is not exhaustive. Additional site suggestions are welcome.

**12. Suggested Reading on Gender and Transport.**

The final tool provides a list of a few useful reports and articles addressing various aspects of gender and transport issues. This also is not exhaustive. Additional suggestions are welcome.





# Introduction:

## Why Gender is a Transport Issue

There is global recognition that gender equality is an important aspect of the three pillars of sustainable development: 1) social inclusion, 2) environmental sustainability, and 3) economic growth; and addressing gender disparities is increasingly recognized as being at the core of the Bank's mandate of economic growth and poverty reduction. Transport networks and services have many positive impacts on women's and men's lives. They increase access to markets for labor and goods, reduce the time and cost of marketing produce, and expand access to services. Gaining a better understanding of the subtle links between gender, poverty, and transport access—including women's time poverty and health, poverty and access services, and reallocation of women's time savings, family welfare and economic development—can help decision-makers and teams develop effective sector strategies and operations more likely to have gender-equitable outcomes.

In Africa, seventy percent of the goods are head-loaded, predominantly by women who make up the majority of the agricultural producers and transporters. In some areas this can take up to eight hours of a woman's time per day.

**Gender differences in transport patterns:** There are important gender differences in transport needs and access that need to be considered in transport planning to ensure maximum positive distributional impacts. Men and women use transport in different ways based on their socially determined gender roles and responsibilities. As women in many developing countries, particularly in rural areas, have to travel by foot for fetching water and fuel for household, they usually bear heavy transport burdens.

**Rural transport issues:** Women's and girls' mobility is often limited by their heavy domestic work load as well as a wide range of cultural constraints. Limited access to transport infrastructure and services affects education, health, and survival of females due to cultural and time constraints. Studies indicate that there is a strong link between girls' school enrollment and road access. Every year many women in developing countries die due to complications arising from pregnancy and child birth, and many of these deaths could be prevented by access to roads and transport services to prenatal and emergency medical care. Road safety in highways and trade corridors (without facilities for pedestrian mobility and protection) going through rural areas is a major issue, especially for women and children.

**Urban transport issues:** Many urban transport systems in developing countries have not been designed to meet the needs of the poor and different groups (e.g. people with disabilities). The most common intervention is road and highway construction that mostly serves private car and truck owners. Lack of transport options hampers access to employment and limits social networks, particularly for women who generally have fewer resources than men. Goods and services are sometimes more expensive in low-income communities due to poor infrastructure and services.

Urban transport service schedules are often based on peak hour travel to work, generally with radial routing to the city center. Off-peak travel to multiple destinations -- combining several tasks (trip chaining) that characterize the travel of many women is often poorly served. Most transport pricing makes this type of multiple travel more expensive than travel directly to work in the city center. Such pricing and scheduling constrains women's access to employment, markets and social services. Transport fares are often beyond the means of the poor, particularly women. Women are more vulnerable to gender-based violence and crime in dimly lit city streets and access points for public transport. Platform and bus/train design rarely takes into account the safety needs of women carrying children and shopping bags or the elderly and disabled. Poor air quality from increasing carbon dioxide emissions from vehicles also has greater impacts on pedestrians and non-motorized transport users, many of whom are women.

**Gender disparity in employment in the transport sector:** Globally, transport and transport-related workers are predominantly male – in road construction and maintenance, transport services, and transport agencies. Like other infrastructure sectors, most transport planning agencies, boards, and advisory committees at all levels are mostly managed by males. This is also true for other infrastructure sectors.

**HIV/AIDS transmission and trafficking:** Globally more than 50 percent of the 42 million people infected with the HIV virus are male, but women's infection rates continue to spiral upward, as they now constitute 58 percent in Sub-Saharan Africa and 68 percent of all young infected persons are female. In Sub-Saharan Africa, research indicate that the increase in HIV/AIDS transmission is associated with construction of roads has had a more negative impact on women than men, in terms of higher infection rates and the burden of caring for persons affected by HIV/AIDS. In Asia, improved transport corridors have also accelerated the spread of HIV/AIDS and like Sub-Saharan Africa; it may have a more negative impact on women. Recognizing these trends, the transport sector has taken action to counter them by requiring contractors to provide HIV/AIDs prevention education to workers, and in many instances affected community members.

**Displacement and resettlement:** Gender inequalities in compensation for displacement and resettlement resulting from transport construction may have negative impacts on family well-being. As land titles are mostly held by men, cash compensation for land or other assets is usually given to the male head of household who may not share it equitably with other family members. Women and others with use rights to land may not be compensated for loss of livelihood.

In Asian cities, despite heavy subsidies on road based and rail-based public transit systems, the poor usually cannot afford the fares and travel by walking or by non-motorized rickshaws. In sub-Saharan African cities, most people walk. Similarly, in Latin American cities, 43 percent the trips are by walking, 33 percent by public transport, 16 percent by auto, and 6 percent by bicycle. Women have fewer resources than men for fares.

**Value added by gender-responsive transport:** Participatory, gender-inclusive assessment of transport needs and transport planning identifies local needs of women and men as well as problems and resources that can affect the outcomes of a project. It also identifies gender and other differences in potential risks and benefits of a project. This analysis enables improved distributional impacts, increased efficiency, and reduced unanticipated adverse impacts of the project. It also builds a sense of local ownership of transport infrastructure and commitment to maintain and repair it, which increases sustainability. Experience has shown that engaging women as well as men in rural and urban transport planning and decision-

making taps their practical experience and often increases quality control and financial transparency. Increasing women's access to transport and markets can increase their productivity and the overall productivity of the household and community.

(Sources: Babinard, Julie and Peter Roberts. 2006. Maternal and Child Mortality Goals, What Can the Private Sector Do? World Bank Transport Sector Board Transport Paper. 12.; Kunieda, Mika and Aimee Gautier. 2007. Gender and Urban Transport: Smart and Affordable. Module 7. Sustainable Transport Sourcebook for Policymakers in Developing Countries. GTZ.; Lema, Antoine, Stephen Brushett, Negede Lewi, John Riverson, and Silue Siele 2003. Taking HIV/AIDS on Africa's Roads. Sub-Saharan Africa Policy Program Technical Note 35.

## (a) Approaches to integrate gender in operations<sup>1</sup>

### Definitions of key terms: Gender, Inclusion, and Empowerment<sup>2345</sup>

**Gender is not another word for women:** Gender refers to the socially constructed roles, and socially learned behaviors and expectations associated with males and females. It is about women *and* men, their socially defined roles, responsibilities, and the power and other relations between them. Like race, ethnicity, and class, being male or female shapes individuals' opportunities to participate in the economy and society.

**Gender equality** refers to equality under the law, equality of opportunity (rewards for work, equality of access to human capital, and other productive resources), and equality of voice (ability to influence and contribute to the development process).

**Empowerment refers to change in relationships among individuals and groups.** Empowerment is a process of enhancing an individual's or group's capacity to make strategic choices and transform those choices into desired actions and outcomes. This involves improving their assets and their capabilities so they can become agents of positive social change on their own behalf.

**Social inclusion refers to change in institutions.** Social inclusion refers to the development of inclusive institutional policies, social norms, and behaviors that provide an opportunity for previously marginalized groups to increase their voice and access to assets.

---

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from World Bank (2003), Social Analysis Sourcebook: Incorporating Social Dimensions into World Bank Supported Projects.

<sup>2</sup> World Bank (2001), Engendering Development through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice. New York: Oxford University Press.

<sup>3</sup> World Bank (\*2006), Gender Equality as Smart Economics: A World Bank Group Gender Action Plan

<sup>4</sup> World Bank (2008) Social Development and Infrastructure: Working in Partnership for Sustainable Development. Social Development Department.

<sup>5</sup> OECD/DAC (2004), Why Gender Matters in Infrastructure. DAC Working Group on Gender Equality.

**Social analysis and sustainability:** Social analysis is an integral part of the project cycle, especially during preparation and appraisal, as it helps task teams to understand the inherent differences between social groups, constraints and risks. It also identifies possible actions that can be taken to reduce disparity and enhance opportunities that can facilitate improved social and economic impacts of investments, and makes development more equitable and sustainable. Social analysis is often informed by a social assessment undertaken by client country as part of project design, especially when social safeguards are triggered. If there is no project social assessment, this analysis relies on other upstream work by the Bank or other agencies.

**Gender analysis:** Women and men are the largest social groups and gender analysis is usually undertaken within social analysis; and includes examination of gender-based roles, responsibilities, access to resources and power relations, as well as needs and constraints. This is carried out through a number of instruments, including desk review, survey and consultation with women and men; and contributes to the social sustainability of operations by facilitating (a) equal participation and “voice” of both women and men; (b) reduction of gender specific risks, if any; and (c) enhanced social and economic opportunities for poor and marginalized women.

In World Bank operations, gender integration is usually undertaken in the following way that is aligned with the project cycle:

**Step 1: Rapid gender review of the proposed operation at the identification or concept stage.** The project task team conducts this review supported by a social development specialist with gender expertise. A checklist (Tool 2) helps the team to undertake this review and identify key gender issues, potential risks and benefits. Consultations with women and men can also provide in-depth information. If the review identifies substantial gender-based risks and constraints in accessing project benefits, further gender analysis can be undertaken during the preparation phase for identifying actions for mitigation. If there are no significant gender-based constraints and risks, further steps on gender analysis and actions may not be necessary. The findings of the rapid review can be documented in the project concept note (PCN).

**Step 2: Gender-responsive social analysis:** The counterpart government usually undertakes social and/or environmental assessments, especially when safeguard policies are triggered. The Bank task team comments on the TOR and supports the field survey and gender-inclusive consultative process. Findings of gender analysis identify possible actions and indicators; and can be incorporated into the project design and Bank’s Project Appraisal Document (PAD). Consultations with women and women’s groups can help **prioritize** key gender actions. A gender plan or framework, with activities, budget and targets can also be developed that helps monitoring progress and getting results. In a transport project, for example, separate toilets for women and men in bus stations are considered gender-responsive activities. Projects can also take targeted activities such as a quota for women’s employment in road construction and maintenance.

**Step 3: Implementation Support:** Bank team provides regular implementation support to activities and monitors progress using the indicators established in the Results Framework, which are usually recorded in the ISR. If needed, capacity building support can be provided to counterpart governments and implementing agencies.

**Step 4: Completion and Impact assessment:** Bank team can support a gender-responsive mid-term review and end project evaluation; which helps document gender-based outcomes in the Implementation Completion Report (ICR).

---

*Sources:* van Riet, Marinke. 2008. An Unbalanced Load: Mainstreaming Gender in the New World Bank Business Strategy. Response by the executive Secretary of the International Forum for Rural Transport and Development. London, May 22; World Bank, 2006. Gender

and Transport Resource Guide. Module 2; World Bank. 2007. Transport and Gender. Gender and Development Briefing Notes. World Bank Gender and Development Group; IFRTD, 2004. From Rhetoric to Practice. Mainstreaming Gender in the Transport Sector. IFRTD Forum News Volume 11, Issue 3. January; Clarke, Mari. 2008. Rural Transport. In Gender and Agricultural Livelihoods Sourcebook. World Bank, FAO and IFAD.; Peters, Deike. 2002. Gender and Transport in Less Developed Countries. Paper commissioned by UNED Forum for Expert Workshop on "Gender Perspectives for the Earth Summit 2002, OECD DAC 2004, Why Gender Matters in Infrastructure. Organization for Economic Development, Working Group on Gender Equality; World Bank, 2001, Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources and Voice.

# 1. Entry Points for Integrating Gender in Transport Policy Dialogue

This checklist provides suggestions to identify entry points and actions needed for integrating gender and other social dimensions of transport into country policy dialogue (PRSPs, Country Partnership Strategies, Country Assistance Strategies, and Country Transport Sector Strategies) in order to reduce gender inequities and increase development effectiveness and sustainability. Each of the points listed can provide an entry point for dialogue if it is in place in the client country. If not in place, some of the points (such as attention to gender in sector strategy and procedure) could provide the basis for dialogue on actions needed, depending on the stage of development of sector policy and procedures. It could also lead to discussion of possible capacity building needs of the client agency. Any dialogue would tap only some of the entry points and actions, not the entire list.

- Does the country have a gender equality policy? What are the requirements? Does it have strong support at the executive level?
- Is there significant gender disparity in social and economic sector indicators (health, literacy, education), labor force participation, wage rate, ownership of asset, business, etc?
- Is there a ministry focal point or unit responsible for advocacy and gender inclusion and/or women's advancement at the national policy and project level?
- Does the country transportation sector strategy address gender issues?
  - Do labor policies provide opportunities for women in labor-based work and women contractors?
  - Is the participation of women promoted or required in the prioritization and design of works?
  - Are there measures to eliminate discriminatory labor or contracting practices?
  - Is there promotion of safe, reliable transport facilities and modes of transport?
  - Are HIV/AIDs prevention and treatment required in construction contracts? Is it recognized as a gender issue as well as a health issue?
  - Is female access to IMTs promoted?
- Do country transportation policy and planning procedures explicitly take gender into account?
  - Are gender gaps and gender specific needs, capacities, constraints and opportunities identified?
  - Is socioeconomic empowerment an integral element?
- Have women and men civil society stakeholders been consulted on transport policies and programs? Included in teams analyzing policy and strategy? Included in decision-making?
- Is privatization of transportation under consideration? What are the implications for pricing and safety factors that could negatively impact poor women and men?
- Are there other policy reforms with significant gender impacts (e.g. increased fuel levies, increased public transport costs, scheduling of transport, retrenchment)?
- What is the ratio of women to men in the transport-related ministries and transport work force at managerial, technical, and support staff levels? Is there gender expertise? Is gender awareness-raising needed?

- Is there a system for monitoring the implementation of gender and other social components of transport sector policies and strategies?
- Does the transport sector budget include resources for:
  - Sex disaggregation of beneficiary data and key gender indicators?
  - Outreach and capacity building on gender and other social dimensions?
  - Grants for addressing gender issues?
  - Maintenance of access roads, footbridges, tracks?
  - Security features (lighting, security officers, safer urban street design)?
  - Pedestrian safety (separate walkways, signage, traffic management)?
- Do agencies that influence sector policy (e.g. Road Fund Boards) have both female and male representation?
- Does investment in the transport sector aim to leverage increases in access to schools, markets, health, financial, and other services?

---

*Source:* Adapted from the World Bank 2007 Gender and Transport Resource Guide, Tools Section.

## 2. Rapid Gender and Transport Review Questions

This tool was developed in response to requests from transport task team leaders and it emphasizes the importance of assessing the extent to which gender may be an issue in a project from the very beginning of the project cycle, rather than as an afterthought. The tool provides a series of questions from which task teams select those most relevant. If the review identifies gender-based risks and constraints in accessing project benefits, further gender analysis during the preparation phase will identify actions for reducing such risks; and providing equitable benefits. If there are no significant gender-based constraints and risks, further gender analysis and actions may not be necessary. The findings of the rapid review are documented in the project concept note (PCN) and inform the design of environmental and social assessments and other studies conducted during project preparation and appraisal.

**Country Social and Institutional Context** *(If responses are mostly positive, the proposed project can design gender-responsive actions to support national mandates, assist reducing disparity, and promote equitable benefits)*

- Does the country have policies or laws related to gender equality or equity (labor laws, property and business ownership, opening a bank account, obtaining passport, holding public office)?
- Does the transport sector have strategies or policies that address gender issues?
- What are the key social, cultural or legal constraints of female mobility compared with male mobility and access to transport planning, services, and jobs? Do these vary by other social characteristics (ethnic, minority, rural/urban, age)?

**Transport Needs** *(If there are gender-based differences in needs, better understanding and targeting of transport can improve project benefits)*

- Do women and men have different transport needs?
- Do women and men use transport services differently? Does this vary by social characteristics (ethnic, minority, rural/urban, age)?

**Economic Opportunities** *(The proposed project can provide equal economic opportunities for both women and men)*

- Is the project expected to facilitate employment creation or income generation?
- Will the project use local labor for road rehabilitation and maintenance?
- Are there barriers to women's labor force participation?
- Does the project include transport sector restructuring and reduction in the labor force?

**Access to health and Education** *(If responses are positive, the proposed project can improve health and education)*

- Are there high rates of maternal mortality? Can transport help address the access aspect of this problem?
- Are there low rates of school enrollment and completion, particularly for girls? Can transport help to address the access aspect of this problem?



**Personal Security and Road Safety** *(If responses are positive, the proposed project can take actions for reducing risks)*

- Is gender-based violence a widespread problem during travel (by foot, public transport etc.)?
- Is there a high rate of pedestrian and non-motorized vehicle accidents?

**Gender-Related Risks** *(If responses are positive, the proposed project can take actions for reducing risks)*

- Is there a high rate of HIV/AIDS infection in the general population? Among the transport sector workers?
- Is there a significant rate of human trafficking using transport routes?

**Gender Aspects of Social Safeguards** *(If there are gender-based differences, the proposed project can take actions for reducing risks)*

- What are the gender differences in effects of involuntary resettlement in transport projects?
- What are the gender differences in project impacts on indigenous people?

---

*Source:* Adapted from: World Bank 2010, Rapid Gender Review Tool for Transport Operations developed under World Bank GAPSNP Activity, Capacity Building for Mainstreaming Gender in Transport Project, G Banjo TTL.

### 3. Key Questions during Transport Project Cycle for Integrating Gender and other Social Dimensions

This tool provides key questions for identifying potential entry points and actions for addressing gender and other social issues during each phase of the project cycle. This also includes suggestions to identify opportunities, risks and benefits for designing effective projects with positive distributional impacts. These questions can be answered through social assessments, environment and social impact assessment (ESIA), poverty and social impact assessment (PSIA) and/or other assessments. All points may not apply in a given project.

#### Project Identification and Concept Stage

- Does the task team include a gender or social development specialist with experience in gender and transport and/or consult with gender experts in the client country?
- Was a rapid gender and transport review (Tool 2) conducted to identify and quantify potential gender and other social issues and impacts affecting access, mobility, risks and benefits?
- If any gender or other social issues were identified in the rapid review, were they discussed in the project concept note?

**Preparation and Design** *(If the rapid gender review identified significant gender concerns that need to be addressed, then the following are key question for undertaking gender-responsive design):*

- Did the TOR of social assessment include key gender transport questions highlighted by rapid review, especially to identify the gender based needs, constraints and opportunities?
- Were both females and males affected by the project included in stakeholder consultations?
- Were separate male and female focus groups used to enable women to voice their views separately from men?
- Was the prioritization of gender-targeted activities within project components done in consultation with both women and men who are expected to benefit from the project?
- Were gender related transport issues that need to be addressed identified? Were approaches for addressing the gender-related issues identified developed?
- Were indicators developed to measure progress on gender-related issues within the relevant project components?

#### Appraisal

- If gender was identified as an issue, were approaches for addressing key gender issues incorporated in the Government project design and Bank's Project Appraisal Document?
- Were adequate resources included in the budget for gender-related activities?
- Do the Project Operations Manual and/or Implementation Manual include the gender and transport activities and indicators for implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of project components?

- Does the institutional capacity development component include ensuring that the implementing agency has the capacity to manage and monitor the gender and transport activities effectively? Provide capacity building and facilitate access to local gender expertise, if needed.
- Is the beneficiary data disaggregated by sex in the results framework and include gender equality indicators where appropriate?
- Do the resettlement action plans provide provisions to compensate women as well as men for loss of livelihood, address gender issues in planning and establishing resettlement sites and ensure sustainability of rehabilitation?

### **Supervision**

- If the project has included a quota for women in project jobs, do the contracts for labor based construction, rehabilitation, or maintenance include clauses that require contractors to hire local women?
- Does the project implementation team involve gender experts throughout the life of the project?
- Is the project team collecting, analyzing and reporting sex-disaggregated beneficiary data and other relevant gender information?
- Have gender-specific risks identified during planning been mitigated?

### **Monitoring and Evaluation**

- Are sex-disaggregated beneficiary data and relevant measures of gender equality integrated into the baselines and other routine transport monitoring and evaluation processes?
- Are gender-responsive data collection methods used to gather baseline and other data(e.g. is information collected from women as well as men, using female as well as male data collectors speaking in local languages)
- Are there measures for the impacts of the project components on women and men?
- Will the value added by women's participation in the project be assessed?
- Does the mid-term review examine progress toward addressing gender issues identified in the project design? Are mid-term corrections needed to ensure that gender issues are addressed?
- Were the gender and transport related results, good practices and lessons learned included in the Implementation Completion Report?
- Is there a plan to disseminate the evaluation findings and use them to inform other policy and projects about gender and transport issues?

---

*Sources: Adapted from the World Bank 2006 Social Analysis in Transport Projects: Guidelines for Incorporating Social Dimensions into Bank-Supported Transport Projects; 2007 Gender and Transport Resource Guide, Tools Section.*

## 4. Developing Effective Project Gender Plans/Frameworks

### Why Use Project Gender Plans/Frameworks?

Gender plans or frameworks are valuable roadmaps for project implementation when gender emerges as a significant issue requiring interventions in one or more project components. In contrast to checklists which identify gender problems and flag possible entry points that might occur across transport projects, a gender plan charts the objectives, activities and indicators for specific gender-related activities within a project's components, providing a means to monitor their implementation and make mid-course corrections. An Asian Development Bank gender assessment of programs it has financed found that well designed project gender plans contributed to the achievement of overall project objectives by reducing the vulnerability of women and their families to poverty and by enhancing the sustainability of benefits to the poor. Gender plans did this by identifying constraints to poor women and men as well as ways to address those constraints. This has resulted in more equitable access to project and program resources including skills training, technology, and government services. Gender plans also contributed to progress toward gender equality in decision-making patterns in the household, mobility, and leadership of community-based organizations.

### Well Designed Gender Plans/Frameworks

Gender action plans are most effective at delivering results when they incorporate the following good practices. No single element by itself is a formula for success.

#### **1. Counterparts are responsible for designing the gender plans**

- Counterparts may need technical support in developing a good social and gender assessment for designing the project.
- A participatory social/gender assessment can facilitate practical gender plans with targets.
- A social/gender assessment will identify gender-based constraints that hamper equal participation of and benefits to women and men from the proposed project.
- If there are constraints, counterparts need to design actions for projects to ensure that women and men can participate and benefit equally from project interventions.
- Counterparts may need capacity building and/or technical assistance in developing these plans.

#### **2. Integrate Gender Plans into the overall project design and project implementation process**

- Gender plans need to be tested and reviewed early in implementation.
- Realistic activities, targets, resources, and responsibilities for implementation need to be identified and incorporated into the project implementation plan and Manual.

### **3. Identify realistic gender targets linked to project objectives.**

- Targets and actions can enable step-by-step progress by bringing incremental changes in reducing gender disparity.
- Linking targets to project objectives helps all stakeholders to understand the rationale for focusing on enhancing women's as well as men's access to and benefits from projects.
- Targets facilitate monitoring of participation and benefits by gender and other relevant social groups.

### **4. Include gender capacity building in the gender plan.**

- Both formal training and ongoing support and mentoring of project implementation staff are needed to develop skills, ownership, and commitment.

### **5. Provide adequate skills and resources for gender plan implementation.**

- Gender and/or social development specialists in the implementing agency and/or project team and adequate resources are essential to ensure that gender action can be effectively implemented.
- Non-governmental organizations contracted to implement project activities should have a demonstrated gender capacity.

### **7. Monitor and follow up gender-responsive targets and activities.**

- Systematic follow up is needed to ensure that policy reforms and gender plans are implemented. Routine monitoring and reporting promotes good results.
- Gender-responsive indicators and gender-related risks must be included in project results frameworks.

---

*Source:* Asian Development Bank. 2009. Project Gender Action Plans: Lessons for Achieving Gender Equality and Poverty Reduction Results. A Briefing Note.

## Key Elements of a Gender Action Plan: Bangladesh Third Rural Infrastructure Project

Project Components	Gender Action Plan Elements
Feeder Roads	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Contractors motivated to recruit women labor (target 3000)</li> <li>▪ Pay equity for women</li> <li>▪ Provision of safety, security, and sanitation facilities women laborers</li> </ul>
Market Infrastructure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Shops allocated to women (target 30 percent)</li> <li>▪ Separate toilet facilities for women and men</li> <li>▪ Training for women on shop management and trade skills</li> <li>▪ Financial services for women</li> <li>▪ Women on market management committees (target 30 percent)</li> </ul>
Growth center markets with areas allocated to women	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Space allocated to women for sales</li> <li>▪ Women's market sections (target 200)</li> <li>▪ Separate toilets for women and men</li> <li>▪ Women participate in management</li> <li>▪ Fostering linkages to market management committees through female representation on trade committees</li> </ul>
Tree plantation and routine maintenance with employment for destitute women	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Labor contracting societies formed</li> <li>▪ Individual bank accounts established and mandatory savings required</li> <li>▪ Skills training for women on road maintenance and tree plantation</li> </ul>
Bridges, culverts, <i>ghats</i> (39) Flood refuge centers (30)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Women UP members consulted on sites and design</li> <li>▪ Specific physical design features for women</li> <li>▪ Waiting rooms and toilets for women at <i>ghats</i></li> </ul>
Union Parishad (local government) Complexes (105) Local user groups Physical design	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Separate room and toilets for Women UP members</li> <li>▪ Women UP members in market management</li> </ul>
Institutional strengthening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Gender awareness training for all stakeholders</li> </ul>

Project Components	Gender Action Plan Elements
(Training -400 UPs, 50 local contractors)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="834 268 1382 296">▪ Gender awareness integrated into UP training</li> <li data-bbox="834 321 1243 348">▪ Sex disaggregated data collection</li> </ul>

---

*Sources:* Adapted from Asian Development Bank. 2003. Making Infrastructure Work for Women and Men in Bangladesh ( prepared by Tulin Pulley, Shireen Latif and Ferdousi Sultana Begum); ADB. 2009. Project Gender Action Plans: Lessons for Achieving Gender Equality and Poverty Reduction Results. Briefing Note.; Lateef, Shireen. 2007. Gender Mainstreaming in ADB. Expert Group Meeting on Financing for Gender Equality and Women’s Improvement. Oslo Norway.; Begum, Ferdousi Sultana 2008. Bangladesh Third Rural Infrastructure Project. Presentation at the conference on Mainstreaming Gender Equality in Infrastructure Projects, Manila, 10-11 November.

## 5. Enhancing Gender Integration in Transport Projects

A number of actions to facilitate inclusive, gender informed transport can be applied effectively to reduce the risk of increasing gender inequalities and maximize the benefits for a wider range of people. Some approaches apply to rural gender and transport issues; others apply in urban settings. This tool provides the rationale for each effective gender-targeted activity, the key actions involved, and examples of good practice case projects that apply each type of activity.

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Effective Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Rural</b>			
<b>Labor intensive road works with gender targets</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Provides employment for rural poor.</li> <li>▪ Reduces risk of introduction of HIV/AIDS by migrant construction workers.</li> <li>▪ Offers opportunities for women’s increased contribution to household income and increased gender equality.</li> <li>▪ Increases sustainability through local sense of ownership.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Assess opportunities and barriers for women’s participation in road work.</li> <li>▪ Contract clauses for road works with targets for local workers and women.</li> <li>▪ Skills training for women to enable their participation.</li> <li>▪ Effective communication to communities about employment opportunities targeted to women as well as men.</li> </ul>	<p>10a Peru Rural Roads Project</p> <p>10b Bangladesh Rural Roads and Markets Project</p>



Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Effective Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Microenterprises for road rehabilitation and maintenance with gender targets</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Provides income for rural poor.</li> <li>▪ Can increase quality and transparency of road maintenance.</li> <li>▪ Opportunity for women's increased contribution to household income and increased gender equality.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Targets for women's participation in microenterprises and leadership positions.</li> <li>▪ Training for women and men on business management and road rehabilitation.</li> <li>▪ Modification of qualifications to recognize women's domestic experience (agricultural work, household management).</li> <li>▪ Awareness-raising to overcome gender stereotypes blocking women's participation.</li> </ul>	<p>10a Peru Rural Roads Project</p> <p>10b Bangladesh Rural Roads and Markets Project</p>
<b>Construction and rehabilitation of basic access routes (tracks, paths, footbridges, feeder roads, inland waterways)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Connecting rural areas to transport hubs and markets increases economic rate of return.</li> <li>▪ Non-motorized transport and walking are predominant modes of transport for rural poor in many countries.</li> <li>▪ Increased access to education and health increases human capital, reduces travel risks.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Consultation with women as well as men about transport needs and priorities.</li> <li>▪ Participatory rural accessibility planning.</li> <li>▪ Linking paths to transport hubs and services.</li> <li>▪ Involving local women and men in supervision, maintenance, and monitoring of basic access routes.</li> </ul>	<p>10a Peru Rural Roads Project</p>

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Effective Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Increasing density of rural markets</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Reduces time and cost of travel to market.</li> <li>▪ Increases market for local produce.</li> <li>▪ Reduces post harvest spoilage.</li> <li>▪ Overcomes obstacles to women's access to markets as buyers and sellers.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Where necessary, establishing a women's section of the markets with targets for women-run businesses.</li> <li>▪ Providing toilet facilities for women and men.</li> <li>▪ Involving local women as well as men in the management of the market.</li> <li>▪ Fostering women's trade organizations and cooperatives.</li> </ul>	10b Bangladesh Rural Roads and Markets Project
<b>Improved access to skilled medical care</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Reduces delay in access that costs lives in pregnancy complications and infant illness.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ IMTs such as motorcycles with sidecar, donkeys with carts.</li> <li>▪ Telecommunications for referrals and advice.</li> <li>▪ Basic access repair and maintenance to maintain passable routes year round.</li> </ul>	Ethiopia Road Sector Development Project
<b>Increased access to intermediate modes of transport (IMTs) for women as well as men</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Motorized transport is often not an option for the rural poor.</li> <li>▪ IMTs can significantly decrease labor burden on fuel and water collection and other domestic tasks done mainly by women and girls.</li> <li>▪ IMT production and maintenance can provide income for local women and men.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Support for local development, production and maintenance of IMTs.</li> <li>▪ Ensuring IMTs are designed to meet women's physical and cultural requirements as well as men's.</li> <li>▪ Providing women access to credit to purchase IMTs individually or as a cooperative.</li> </ul>	

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Effective Gender Targeted Activities
<p><b>Labor saving technologies</b> ( potable water, woodlots, fuel efficient stoves)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Non-transport solutions can be the most cost-effective way to reduce the domestic transport burden.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Integrated rural development planning.</li> <li>▪ Consultation with women as well as men about priorities and locations for potable water.</li> <li>▪ Woodlots to provide near access to fuel-wood</li> <li>▪ Biogas, solar, LPG gas alternatives where economically feasible.</li> <li>▪ Access to microcredit for purchase of fuel efficient stoves.</li> </ul>	

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Urban</b>			
<b>Safety measures to protect pedestrians and NMTs</b> (bicycles, hand and animal drawn carts)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Walking and NMTs are predominant transport modes of the poor in many cities.</li> <li>▪ Priority is usually given to motorized traffic which increases risks for NMTs and pedestrians.</li> <li>▪ More women walk in most countries.</li> <li>▪ Pedestrians are frequent victims of traffic accidents.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Pedestrian walkways with barriers to vehicles and restrictions on vendors blocking paths.</li> <li>▪ NMT lanes.</li> <li>▪ Pedestrian and NMT bridges for large roads.</li> <li>▪ Traffic-calming measures (lights, traffic bumps, medians, traffic police).</li> <li>▪ Pedestrian-friendly traffic laws.</li> <li>▪ Better enforcement.</li> </ul>	10d China Liaoning Medium Cities Transport Project
<b>Security measures to reduce street and point of transport crime, particularly gender-based violence</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Dark streets and transportation transit points facilitate crime.</li> <li>▪ Gender-based violence is a serious problem in many cities globally, restricting women's mobility.</li> <li>▪ Harassment of women often occurs on public buses, trains and other modes of public transport.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Improved street and transit point lighting.</li> <li>▪ Female security officers on transport platforms and on transport modes.</li> <li>▪ Where necessary and affordable, separate buses and train cars for women.</li> <li>▪ Separate restrooms for women and men in stations.</li> <li>▪ Improved urban planning to reduce abandoned buildings and other areas that facilitate crime.</li> </ul>	10d China Liaoning Medium Cities Transport Project

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Urban</b>			
<b>Increased public transport services during off-peak hours</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Many women and some men engage in trip-chaining travel that combines several tasks in a multi-segment trip (e.g. business, taking children to school and health care, community service).</li> <li>▪ Most transport systems are designed and scheduled to serve travel to work in the city center during peak hours.</li> <li>▪ Off-peak travel outside the city center is usually lower frequency and is time consuming and costly, wasting potentially productive time.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Expand hours and routes of public transport, possibly using smaller vehicles.</li> </ul>	10d Liaoning Medium Cities Transport Project
<b>Fare changes to reduce cost of trip-chaining</b>	Same as above	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Change fare schedules to reduce cost during off-peak hours.</li> <li>▪ Bus passes to enable travel in multiple segments without paying separate fares.</li> <li>▪ Flat rates rather than by distance reduces the burden of cost for the poor living in peripheral areas.</li> </ul>	10d Liaoning Medium Cities Transport Project

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Urban</b>			
<b>Transport design features to accommodate women with children and bags, the elderly, disabled.</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Buses and trains and platforms are generally designed to accommodate male travelers' size and strength.</li> <li>▪ Women, children and the elderly may have difficulty entering trains and buses and reaching hand straps.</li> <li>▪ Accommodations for packages, baby strollers, wheelchairs, etc are often inadequate.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Platforms designed for entry safely.</li> <li>▪ Transport security officers assisting women, elderly, disabled to enter transport.</li> <li>▪ Modification of strap length, seats and other features to accommodate women, children and the elderly.</li> </ul>	
<b>Rural and Urban</b>			
<b>Conduct transport user surveys to identify travel patterns, needs and constraints of women and men</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Assessment of all user needs is essential to design transport system that serve all people not just motorized transport.</li> <li>▪ Public consultation builds public support for transportation initiative</li> <li>▪ Separate consultation of women and men often results in practical considerations that would be overlooked without women's input</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Consult local women and men using surveys and focus groups on transport patterns needs and constraints.</li> <li>▪ Consult again to get feedback on how effectively the transport project has incorporated their suggestions.</li> <li>▪ Conduct consultations during implementation.</li> <li>▪ Involve local women and men in the evaluation of the transport project.</li> </ul>	10d China Liaoning Medium Cities Transport Project

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Urban</b>			
<b>Building gender and social awareness and capacity of transport implementing agencies</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Transport implementation agencies are essential to ensure sustainability of gender informed transport initiatives</li> <li>▪ Most of these agencies lack expertise in analyzing and addressing gender and other social dimensions of transport.</li> <li>▪ The focus tends to be on hardware –roads, bridges, canals, ports-- rather than their positive or negative impacts on the people who are affected by their construction.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Establish social/gender positions within agency staffing.</li> <li>▪ Conduct awareness raising training.</li> <li>▪ Partner social and engineering experts on teams to assess potential social impacts.</li> <li>▪ Assist in incorporating gender/social dimensions in monitoring and evaluation systems and procedural manuals.</li> </ul>	<p>10a Peru Rural Roads Project</p> <p>10b Bangladesh Rural Roads and Markets Project</p> <p>10e Ethiopia Road Sector Development Project</p>
<b>Gender sensitive HIV/AIDS prevention</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ It is widely recognized that transportation routes can facilitate the spread of HIV/AIDS, and prevention measures are required.</li> <li>▪ Fewer projects address the gendered nature of HIV/AIDS (e.g. power relations of males and females making it difficult for women to say no; greater biological susceptibility of women; male gender role expectations leading to risky behavior and gender violence).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Public awareness campaigns using a wide range of media to reach women as well as men.</li> <li>▪ Workplace prevention programs providing male and female condoms and awareness education, including reduction of violence toward women.</li> <li>▪ Targeting at risk groups (truckers, boat crews, construction workers and their wives, commercial sex workers) with education, testing, treatment and care.</li> </ul>	<p>West Africa Abidjan-Lagos Corridor Project in 8. “Gender Sensitive HIV/AIDS Prevention”</p>

Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Urban</b>			
<b>Equitable resettlement compensation and livelihood restoration</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Too often resettlement compensation has targeted male “heads of household” with negative impacts on women and children in the household.</li> <li>▪ Women are impacted more by the disruptions of resettlement than men.</li> <li>▪ A more participatory resettlement process can reduce complaints and unintended negative impacts.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Include women as well as men in the affected persons’ survey.</li> <li>▪ Involve affected women and men in resettlement planning.</li> <li>▪ Give multiple options for compensation.</li> <li>▪ Provide livelihood training to women as well as men</li> <li>▪ Jointly title resettlement property in wife’s and husband’s names.</li> <li>▪ Deposit women’s cash compensation in individual bank accounts in their names.</li> </ul>	10c Mumbai Urban Transport Project  See also 9. “Inclusive Involuntary Displacement and Resettlement Checklis
<b>Partnerships with capable NGOs and local women’s organizations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Capable local organizations can effectively mobilize participation of women as well as men and provide training and public awareness building at a relatively low cost.</li> <li>▪ Not all local women’s organizations have the capacity to provide this type of support to local transport agencies for transportation projects. Capacity building and technical support may be required.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Conducting an institutional capacity assessment of local organizations.</li> <li>▪ Fostering partnerships between local organizations and local government.</li> <li>▪ Providing capacity building for local organizations where appropriate.</li> </ul>	10b Bangladesh Rural Roads and Markets Project  10c Mumbai Urban Transport Project



Effective Gender Targeted Activities	Rationale	Key Actions	Projects Using Gender Targeted Activities
<b>Urban</b>			
<b>Use of Gender Informed Monitoring and Evaluation for Project Design</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Effective monitoring and evaluation is an important management tool.</li> <li>▪ Sex and other relevant disaggregation of beneficiary indicators is essential to ensure equitable distributional impacts.</li> <li>▪ Gender indicators enable the assessment of progress toward greater gender equality.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Sex disaggregating beneficiary indicators.</li> <li>▪ Developing relevant gender indicators to assess progress toward greater gender equality.</li> <li>▪ Using qualitative as well as quantitative data collection methods.</li> <li>▪ Ensuring that times for interviews and discussion groups fit women’s domestic and other work schedules.</li> <li>▪ Interviewing women by women separately from men to ensure that they can freely express their views.</li> </ul>	<p>10a Peru Rural Roads Project</p> <p>See also: 6. “Transport Results: Examples of Gender Informed Indicators”</p>

*Sources:* World Bank. 2010. Making Infrastructure Work for Women and Men: A Portfolio Review of Infrastructure Projects 1995-2009, Social Development Department; Alling, Gred, Ellen Brazier, Deena Burjorjee, Andrea Camoens and Any Webber. Ranking, Beth. 1999. Gender and Transport, a Strategy for Africa. 1997. Mainstreaming Gender in Transport: A Toolkit. Prepared for the Gender Analysis and Policy Group, World Bank.

## 6. Inclusive Involuntary Displacement and Resettlement Checklist

Another important entry point for addressing gender and transport issues is through the resettlement and livelihoods restoration process. Although women, the elderly, children and the handicapped are often recognized as vulnerable groups that need assistance, this does not necessarily translate into equitable allocation of compensation and livelihood rehabilitation. Too often compensation is provided to male heads of households assuming it will be shared within the household. There is ample evidence that this is often not the case. When empowered as decision-makers and mobilizers in the resettlement process, women's organizations have facilitated equitable resettlement processes with minimum complaints or conflict. When gender is ignored in this process, women may lose access to resources and networks vital to the survival of their children and themselves and their role as mobilizers and mediators is lost as well. Key questions to guide attention to gender throughout the resettlement process (consultation and participation, resettlement planning, and resettlement and rehabilitation) are listed below.

### Consultation and Participation

- Have women as well as men, representing all socioeconomic categories, been consulted about the project?
- Do women as well as men have any information about the proposed project?
- Have women as well as men been consulted on the resettlement plan?
- Were women as well as men involved in developing the resettlement plan? Were their inputs solicited?
- Have women as well as men been consulted in identifying affected persons?
- How will the plan be shared with affected women and men?
- Is there a mechanism for ensuring women's as well as men's participation at each stage of the project?
- Should there be separate meetings for women using female facilitators to solicit women's views (especially on such sensitive issues as toilets, sanitation, water, and house plans)?

### Resettlement Planning

#### Data Collection

- Is the socioeconomic survey gender-disaggregated?
- Has information been collected on women's as well as men's land and property status?
- Does the survey include questions on household division of labor, household decision-making on finances and resource use, women's and men's formal and informal income sources, extent of women's and men's dependence on livestock, home garden, and forest use, and women's and men's contribution to family income?

### **Determining Eligibility for Compensation**

- Do women and men have legal title to land and property?
- What ownership, access, and control do women have over resources and property, compared with men? (Examine existing land and property laws to identify any provisions or entitlements for women.)
- Will women's and men's sources of livelihood be affected?
- What legal instruments apply?
- Do women and men have customary or informal rights to land, property, and other resources?

### **Developing Resettlement and Compensation Options**

- How does the law for compensation define "persons eligible for compensation"?
- Does the law entitle women to compensation assistance?
- What are the compensation and resettlement options selected by women compared with men?
- Were women as well as men included in consultations on compensation options?
- Did the planners consider making payments or giving land titles in the name of both spouses?
- Did the planners consider providing separate compensation to women for loss of income, even from informal sector activities and loss of assets like ponds, forests, rivers, etc.?
- Did the planners consider developing separate options for livelihood restoration programs for women?

## **Rehabilitation and Resettlement**

### **Site Selection**

- Have affected women as well as men, representing all socioeconomic groups, been shown the alternative sites?
- How far is the site from their existing homes?
- Have women as well as men approved the site?
- What concerns have they expressed? Have these concerns been taken into account?
- Is the site close to the women's and men's current places of employment or income generation?

### **Housing**

- Were women as well as men consulted on the structure and design of the housing? What are their specific needs?
- Do women and men prefer to undertake the construction on their own with money or materials from the government or do they want the government to provide the housing?
- Are women and men willing to contribute toward housing finance?

- What measures are being taken to address women's concerns regarding housing?
- What are the women's as well as men's suggestions regarding settlement design?

#### **Habitability and Safety**

- Have issues of habitability and safety been addressed with both women and men?
- Are women more vulnerable to violence in the new settlement? How will this be addressed?
- Are there potential safety issues in the new settlement? How will these be addressed?
- Does the location and/or design of the new settlement restrict women's mobility?

#### **Infrastructure**

- What infrastructure needs have women identified?
- What services will be needed for men, women and children?
- How will the site and services be maintained?

#### **Sanitation**

- Will there be bathing areas within the houses or common bathing spaces? How many families will use each common facility? What are the mechanisms for maintaining these?
- Is there a requirement for separate bathing places/toilet facilities/washing slabs for women? What is the best design and location for these facilities?
- Where are the community toilets located? How many families are there per toilet?
- Is there lighting in public spaces and around toilet facilities to ensure the safety of women and girls?
- What are the mechanisms for waste disposal and sewage disposal and what is the role of the community?

#### **Education**

- How many school age girls and boys are there?
- Are there existing facilities in the relocation site, such as an elementary or a high school?
- Is it physically accessible to the new settlers?
- Can existing facilities accommodate the children of the new settlers? If not, what are the requirements to meet their schooling needs?

#### **Health Care**

- What are the common diseases of women, men, children in the area? Are they related to existing living conditions?

- What health facilities are available at the new site? Will they be sufficient for new settlers?
- Are health facilities accessible to women and children?
- Is there any risk for introduction of new diseases in the relocation site?

#### **Transition to New Settlement**

- Have women been consulted on transportation and transit issues?
- Is public transportation or NMT provided? Are women aware of the transportation arrangements?
- Have women and other vulnerable groups, who may need special assistance with transportation, been identified?
- Is ample time provided for dismantling and resettlement, especially for female-headed households and the elderly?
- What arrangements have been made for ensuring access to basic facilities and access to schools for children in the interim phase?

#### **Compensation**

- What form of compensation do women receive—cash, bank account, or check?
- Has the payment of compensation in joint names been considered?
- Do the women have bank or postal accounts in their name to receive compensation?
- Are there provisions to ensure that women have an account?
- Have men been consulted on payment of compensation in joint names?
- Is there any possibility of separate cash compensation payment for women?
- What is the likely risk to women of paying compensation and other cash assistance in joint names or wholly to women? Can the risks be minimized?

#### **Security of Tenure**

- Is the resettlement land allocated as ownership title or lease?
- Have women been informed about the nature of titles to the new land and housing?
- What provisions are made for women as well as men who do not have ownership rights over land/property taken over by the project?

#### **Livelihood Restoration**

- Are the women and men being thrust into a cash economy from a rural subsistence economy? Does it mean loss of subsistence?
- Will women's and men's income sources be affected?

- How will women's and men's livelihoods be affected? Will there be total loss of livelihood source or a decrease in income only?
- Does the new site provide the same or alternative opportunities for both women and men to earn incomes?
- What are the existing levels of women's and men's skills and training?
- Is there a need to upgrade women's as well as men's skills; and are the facilities available?

#### **Grievance Redress Mechanisms**

- Is the grievance redress mechanism structured to address gender issues?
- Is the Grievance Redress Committee (GRC) gender sensitive?
- Does the GRC take into account special problems faced by women?
- Are there any women members on the GRC or related group that has been or will be constituted?

#### **Resettlement Budget**

- Does the resettlement plan identify the financial resources required for gender-targeted activities?
- Are specific provisions to address gender issues included in the budget line items?

---

*Source:* Adapted from Asian Development Bank, 2003. Gender Checklist Resettlement.

## 7. Transport Results Indicators: Gender-Responsive Examples

Gender-responsive monitoring and evaluation is essential to ensure that gender and transport and related social issues addressed in the project design are implemented, progress monitored, and the impacts assessed. Indicators are linked to development objectives; and measure the outcome of the projects. Gender indicators track progress toward reducing gender disparities in transport access, mobility, employment, and business opportunities. The World Bank, especially the Sustainable Development Network (SDN), has established core indicators for monitoring progress. For IDA, the projects also need to report on the number of direct male and female beneficiaries. The following list provides examples of gender-responsive indicators for a number of common transport project outcomes. **These are not the Transport core indicators.** They are suggested additional indicators that task teams can include in their Results Framework for monitoring gender outcomes. The list is not exhaustive. A transport project with gender issues would only apply those indicators relevant to the gender actions taken and project development objective.

**The following is a Transport core indicator that can be divided and monitored by male and female**

[Share of rural population with access to an all-season road \(proportion\)](#) (If possible, this can be divided by proportion of male and female with access to an all-season road.)

### Other suggested indicators

#### Improved Access

- Increased number of women and men within two kilometers of an all-weather road
- Travel time for men and women to essential services
- Reduced time required for transfer of women with obstructed labor to emergency care
- Reduced time required for girls and boys to travel to school
- Increased school enrollment and completion rates for both girls and boys
- Expanded off-peak transport services

#### Increased Income, Employment and Entrepreneurship

- Number of women and men employed in transport construction, transport services, and government transport agencies
- Number of women and men operating transport-related services
- Increased women's and men's income from produce marketed using transport services
- Increased women's and men's income from transport employment and enterprises

### **Time-Saving and Increased productivity**

- Reduced women's and men's time for domestic transport tasks (water, fuel-wood, food crop collection, food processing)
- Reduced women's and men's time for transport to work, market, other destinations
- Increased production of cash crops using time saved on domestic transport tasks

### **Improved Affordability**

- Percentage of income spent by women and men on transport tariffs
- Increased participation in transport decision-making to ensure the affordability of transport
- Increased safety and security
- Reduced incidence of harassment, crime and rape on streets, on transport and in transit points
- Reduced male and female pedestrian accident rates
- HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention
- Increased awareness of HIV/AIDS transmission and prevention by commercial sex workers, transport workers, and their wives.
- Increased use of condoms
- Reduced male and female incidence of HIV/AIDS
- Increased number of women and men reached by trafficking awareness campaigns
- Reduced number of males and females trafficked

### **Increased Gender Equality**

- Number of women and men participating in and leading road committees
- Number of women and men managers in rural and urban transport agencies
- Number of women in control of their transport-related income who establish bank accounts
- Increased recognition of women's contributions to the household and community

---

**Sources:** Sourcebook for Policy Makers in Developing Countries. GTZ. Revised in 2007. Clarke, Mari. 2008. Rural Transport., in Gender and Agriculture Sourcebook. World Bank, FAO, and IFAD. Maramba, Petronella and Michael. Bamberger. 2001. A Gender-Responsive Monitoring and Kunieda, Mika and Aimee Gautier. 2006. Gender and Urban Transport: Smart and Affordable. Sustainable Transport Evaluation System for Rural Travel and Transport Programs in Africa: A Handbook for Planners, Managers and Evaluators, SSATP Working Paper No. 55. Rankin, Elizabeth. 1999. Gender and Transport: A Strategy for Africa. World Bank. 2010. Mainstreaming Gender in Road Transport: Operational Guidance for World Bank Staff. Transport Sector Board. TP-28.



## 8. Sample Gender-Responsive Public Transportation User Survey

The following User Survey can be adapted to fits the specific needs of a transport project and to respond to local cultural constraints on mobility and access.

Introduction: My name is \_\_\_\_\_. I am conducting a survey of public transportation users for \_\_\_\_\_, so we can better ensure that the services meet your needs. May I ask you a few questions?

1. What is the purpose of your travel today? (check all that apply)

- Job/employment/business activities
- Education/training
- Taking the children to/from school
- Accessing health or other social services
- Marketing/shopping
- Visiting friends/relatives
- Other

2. Where did you start this journey? \_\_\_\_\_

3. Did you start today's trip at the transport point nearest to your house? \_\_\_\_\_

If not, why not \_\_\_\_\_

4. How many minutes did you walk to your first transport point? \_\_\_\_\_

5. How many vehicles have you used/taken to get to this stop? \_\_\_\_\_

6. How many more vehicles will you take to get to your final destination? \_\_\_\_\_

7. Including walking to the bus stop, how many stages are there in your trip, from your point of departure to your final destination? \_\_\_\_\_

8. How many minutes have you been waiting here for transport? \_\_\_\_\_

9. Including walking and waiting, how long will it take you to go from your point of departure to your final destination? \_\_\_\_\_

10. What mode of transport are you waiting for now?

- Public Bus
- Public Minibus
- Public Trolley

- Light Rail
- Taxi
- Informal sector transport
- Whoever arrives first
- Other \_\_\_\_\_

10b. Is this an expensive or inexpensive mode of transport \_\_\_\_\_

11. What factors influence your choice of transport mode? (check all that apply)

- Routing
- Scheduling
- Fare cost
- Purpose of travel
- Safety/security

11b. Which factor is most important to you? \_\_\_\_\_

12. Do the available transport routes affect your decisions about any of the following activities?

(check all that apply)

- Job, employment, business
- Education, training
- Taking the children to and from school
- Accessing health and other social services
- Marketing, shopping
- Visiting friends, relatives
- Other \_\_\_\_\_

12b. How do available transport routes affect your decisions about these Activities? \_\_\_\_\_

13. Does transport scheduling affect your decisions about any of the following activities?

- Education, training
- Taking the children to and from school
- Accessing health and other social services
- Marketing, shopping
- Visiting friends, relatives
- Other \_\_\_\_\_

13b. How does transport scheduling affect your decisions about these activities?

---

14. Do issues of safety/security affect your decisions about any of the following?

Education, training

Taking the children to and from school

Accessing health and other social services

Marketing, shopping

Visiting friends, relatives

Other \_\_\_\_\_

14b. How do issues of safety and security affect your decisions about these activities? \_\_\_\_\_

---

15. Do transport fares/pricing affect your decisions about any of the following activities?

Education, training

Taking the children to and from school

Accessing health and other social services

Marketing, shopping

Visiting friends, relatives

Other \_\_\_\_\_

15b. How do issues of safety and security affect your decisions about these activities?

---

16. How much will your total journey cost you from point of origin to final destination? \_\_\_\_\_

17. How many trips did you make last week? \_\_\_\_\_

18. Can you tell me your total individual monthly income from all sources? \_\_\_\_\_

19. What portion of your income do you spend on transport? \_\_\_\_\_

20. Are you satisfied with available transport options?

21. What improvements would you like to see made?

More frequent transport (How frequent? Every \_\_\_\_\_ minutes)

More reliable scheduling

Additional routes from \_\_\_\_\_ to \_\_\_\_\_

Less crowding

- More seats
- More and better lighting
- More and better toilet facilities for women and men

22. How much extra fare would you be willing to pay if these improvements were made? \_\_\_\_\_

Interviewer \_\_\_\_\_ Location \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_ Time \_\_\_\_\_

Day:  weekday  weekend  market day

Respondent:  female  male Age:  <15  15-50  >50

---

*Sources:* Adapted from Alling, Gred, Ellen Brazier, Deena Burjorjee, Andrea Camoens and Amy Webber. 1997. Mainstreaming Gender

in Transport Projects: A Toolkit. Report to the Gender Analysis and Policy Group, World Bank. Kudat, Ayse. 1996. Ashqabat Urban Transport Project Report of a Social Assessment. World Bank.

## 9. Gender-Responsive HIV/AIDS Prevention

### Why HIV/AIDS is a gender and a transport issue

Long-range ground transport is a major route for the spread of HIV/AIDS, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa, Asia, and increasingly in Europe and Central Asia. Construction sites and transport hubs, particularly border check points, are often hot spots for HIV/AIDS transmission due to the influx and interaction that takes place among mobile workers and members of local communities. Transport employees, including long distance truck drivers, seafarers, airline crews, and infrastructure construction workers, are at high risk of contracting HIV/AIDS. They spend long periods of time away from home, often with poor working conditions. Many engage in unsafe sex that can lead to infection. Construction sites are commonly located in underdeveloped areas surrounded by impoverished communities eager to engage with construction workers with disposable income to purchase sex. Increasing incidence of HIV/AIDS strains both health and transport systems. Absenteeism, declining productivity, rising health care costs as well as recruitment and training expenses caused by HIV/AIDS place a serious burden on the transport sector that impacts the wider economy. The transport sector can also serve as a very important conduit for HIV/AIDS prevention and referral to appropriate voluntary screening, testing, and treatment facilities.

Cultural norms about male and female behavior shape sexual behavior resulting in different risks and vulnerabilities for women and men that need to be taken into account in HIV/AIDS prevention programs in the transport sector. The tools below include: a check list of basic questions to ask to develop gender informed HIV/AIDS programs within transport projects; good practice examples of HIV/AIDS policy in the transport sector; National Road Administration standards for contracts for road works requiring HIV/AIDS programs and employment of women; and an HIV/AIDS prevention program for the Abidjan–Lagos Corridor. These good practices can be adapted to fit the conditions of transport projects in other settings where HIV/AIDS is a serious issue. For more in-depth guidance, see *Transport Against HIV/AIDS: Synthesis of Experience and Best Practices*, (2009 World bank Transport Sector Board Paper Number 25).

#### Checklist for Gender-Responsive HIV/AIDS Prevention Work

1. Do your programs consider differences in gender roles, access to resources and decision-making that effect women's and men's abilities to protect themselves from HIV/AIDS? From violence?
2. Are women's organizations involved in policy and program decision-making processes?
3. Do your interventions combat violence against women and girls?
4. Do your programs encourage couples, parents and/or children to discuss sexual health, taking into account cultural as well as health considerations?
5. Do your communication and training programs encourage men to respect women's rights to say no to sex or request condom use?
6. Do your interventions aim to develop and strengthen men's concern and caring for their families?
7. When promoting safer sex, do your programs:
  - Challenge double standards between women and men regarding teenage sexuality, casual sex, and sex outside marriage?

- Address difficulties in condom use from men's and women's perspectives?
- Teach both women and men how to use condoms?
- Promote easier access to condoms for women and men?
- Enhance women's and men's skills in negotiating safe sex?
- Build women's self-confidence to negotiate or say no?
- Address sexual abuse, assault, coercion?

*Sources:* World Bank. 2004. Integration of Gender Issues in Selected Projects in the Africa Region: A baseline Assessment. Africa Region Human Development Working Paper Series No.67; 2009. Transport Against HIV/AIDS: Synthesis of Experience and Best Practice Guidelines. Transport Sector Board Transport Paper 25. UNAIDS Interagency Task Team on Gender and HIV AIDS 2005. Resource Pack on Gender and HIV/AIDS.

### **Common HIV/AIDS Prevention Strategies in Transport Operations**

- **Behavior and education campaigns:** Raising awareness of risks for transport workers, sex workers, and local communities. These can use a variety of media such as radio, street theater, and peer educators.
- **Condom use:** Identifying and overcoming barriers to use; increasing condom sales points in high risk areas, so marketing, working with trucker associations and NGOs.
- **Linking HIV campaign to Sexually Transmitted Infection (STI) Treatment and Voluntary Counseling and Testing (VCT) services:** Linking to Ministry of Health and other programs for confidential low cost testing and treatment.
- **Workplace strategies to minimize behavior risk in transport operations:** Reducing the length of time away from home; safe, clean accommodations with information on HIV.
- **Fighting stigma and discrimination:** Transport unions and Associations of People Living with HIV/AIDS (PLHIV) can advocate for policies that ensure that HIV/AIDS testing is not used to screen job applicants, sensitizing health officers and communities on the rights of PLHIV, setting up self-support groups of PLHIV.

*Source:* 2009. Transport Against HIV/AIDS: Synthesis of Experience and Best Practice Guidelines. Transport Sector Board Transport Paper 25.

### **Good Practice: HIV/AIDS Policy of the Transport Sector of Zimbabwe**

The transport sector of Zimbabwe incorporated gender considerations in two of the objectives for its HIV/AIDS policy:

- Prevent HIV and sexually transmitted infections by promoting sustained behavior change through comprehensive workplace programs.

Among other actions that Enterprises should take:

- Provide male and female condoms in the workplace and educate on and encourage their correct use.

- Mainstream gender into workplace policies and programs.

Enterprises should:

- Put in place gender sensitive policies and procedures for protecting employees against gender-based discrimination in the workplace.
- Provide training on gender dimensions of HIV/AIDS and gender awareness to management, employers and spouses.
- Implement programs that target men and women explicitly or separately, taking into account cultural dimensions.
- Implement programs that help women enforce their rights.
- Provide counseling services and awareness sessions to employees and spouses.
- Encourage joint counseling and testing of employees and their spouses.

*Source:* HIV/AIDS Policy for the Transport Sector of Zimbabwe. 2003. prepared by the ILO Project on HIV/AIDS prevention in the Transport Sector of Southern Africa Project Advisory Committee. Zimbabwe.

**Good Practice:**

**Mozambique National Road Administration Contract Specifications for  
HIV/AIDS Programs and Women's Employment**

The Africa region was the first to require clauses on HIV/AIDS prevention requirements in contracts for construction work. Mozambique carried this a step further, including clauses requiring hiring of local people, 25 percent of whom are to be women, and representation of women on the project community liaison committee in the following contract clauses:

**HIV/AIDS considerations:** Road construction projects can contribute significantly to the spread of the HIV virus due to the migrant nature of a large proportion of the workforce. Road projects also provide an opportunity to provide focused education to both the workforce and the local community of the dangers of HIV/AIDS and methods to reduce the risk of infection. This needs to be complemented with measures to help mitigating the impact of the epidemic. The Employer has therefore decided to implement an HIV/AIDS Program under all road works contracts: This would include activities to increase awareness of the dangers of HIV/AIDS and to promote appropriate preventative measures as well as to reducing the impact on those already infected or affected. The Contractor is required to implement the following measures to reduce the risk of the spread of HIV/AIDS as a result of the project: 1) Undertake HIV/AIDS awareness and prevention activities as well as activities aimed at reducing the impact of the epidemic specified in this Contract; 2) Minimize the number of migrant workers employed on the project and housed in the site camp.

**Participation of women:** The Employer has a policy of promoting the employment of women at all levels of the management and execution of road works projects. Requirements for female participation in the Key Personnel and the Workforce are specified in this Contract. Qualified female workforce should be searched for in the project area. If possible, qualified female workforce should be offered refreshing or upgrading vocational training, to thus make it possible for women to qualify for recruitment.

**HIV/AIDS prevention and mitigation:** Road construction projects can contribute significantly to the spread of HIV/AIDS due to the migrant nature of a large proportion of the work force. At the same time, road projects also provide an opportunity to provide focused education to both the workforce and the local community on the dangers of HIV/AIDS and methods to reduce the risk of infection. The contract specifications require contractors to implement the specific measures to reduce the risk of the spread of HIV/AIDS as a result of the project.

**Employment of women and local people:** The scope also explains that the National Road Administration has a policy of promoting employment of women at all levels of management and execution of road works projects. Qualified female workforce should be searched for in the project areas and where possible, offered refresher or upgrading training to enable them to qualify for recruitment. Targets for women's are at least 5 percent of the total number of key personnel and at least 25 percent of the total workforce. Targets for local employment are set as well at 40 percent of the wages paid to the total workforce.

**Relationship with local communities:** The contract specifications document stresses the importance of the relationship between project staff and the local communities, government officials and traditional leaders to the overall success of the project. It requires consultations with government officials and community leaders, represented by women and men in the project areas prior to commencement of site activities and their representation on the project liaison committee. Well-publicized public meetings are required to inform the local business community and the public of the employment and business opportunities that will be available to them and to explain the procedures for hiring of skilled and unskilled workers and selection of local suppliers and sub-contractors.

*Source:* .Source: Mozambique National Road Administration 2005. Special Contract Specifications for Contract Documents.



## Good Practice:

### Combatting HIV/AIDS Along the Abidjan-Lagos Corridor



Thirty million people live along the Abidjan-Lagos Corridor. Estimated HIV prevalence rates range from 3 to over nine percent. About 80 percent of the truck drivers and sex workers in large cities along the corridor are HIV positive. The Western Africa HIV/AIDS Project for the Abidjan-Lagos Transport Corridor was the first regional project aiming to reduce the impact of HIV on the transport sector. The project aimed to increase access to HIV/AIDS prevention, treatment, support, and care services for underserved vulnerable groups (truck drivers,

female traders, and sex workers) through a participatory process. The project had prevention, care and support, coordination, training, and policy components. The prevention component focused on male and female condom social marketing, information, education and communication tailored to specific audiences including community outreach and training for health officers. It also trained female sex workers about HIV/AIDS prevention and provided free female condoms and grants to take formal jobs. The project partnered with the West African Network of People Living with HIV/AIDS (PLHIV) and supported five national PLHIV networks and 17 local PLHIV associations. These PLHIV networks played a vital role in reducing HIV stigma and discrimination along the corridor and providing psychosocial and nutritional care and support to people infected and affected by HIV/AIDS along the corridor.

The project also aimed to reduce the time spent at border crossings by undertaking checkpoint studies to understand the bottle necks and identify measures to address them. The project informed female traders of their rights and the documentation required for crossing borders to avoid harassment and sexual exploitation at border checkpoints. The project also helped strengthen women's organizations' capacity to raise awareness of the rights and needs of people living with HIV/AIDS.

As a result of these initiatives, knowledge of how to prevent HIV increased in the primary target populations from 50-68 percent to 83-88 percent. Reported use of condom in last sexual encounter increased from less than 60 percent to 70 percent for sex workers and 79 percent for truck drivers. Nearly 28 thousand people along the corridor accessed VCT services and 8.8 million condoms were distributed. The Love Caravan HIV/AIDS Prevention media campaign reached 800 million people.

**Sources:** World Bank.2007. Transport and Gender. Gender and Development Briefing Notes. World Bank Gender and Development Group; 2010: Transporting HIV/AIDS Prevention Across Borders: The HIV/AIDS Project for the Abidjan-Lagos Corridor. Carol Hooks and Siele Silue. Global HIV/AIDS Program.

## 10. Good Practice Cases

### Good Practice Case: Peru Rural Roads II (2001 to 2006)

#### Country Context

One out of five Peruvians is Poor. In rural areas, 78 percent of the population is poor and 51 percent is extremely poor. Poverty is particularly high in the mountains and highlands and the jungle areas where the population is predominantly indigenous people. The Peru Rural Roads Project was implemented in the 12 departments ranked highest for rural poverty, primarily in the Sierra (Ancash, Apurimac, Ayacucho, Cajamarca, Cusco, Huancavelica, Huanuco, Junin, Madre de Dios, Pasco, Puno and San Martin).

Poverty is higher for women and indigenous groups. Twenty percent of the households are headed by women. In the central and southern Sierra, women constitute almost a third of the agricultural producers. Poverty is highly correlated with the education of the head of household. Adult literacy is 93.5 percent for males and 82.1 percent for females overall. However, the lowest female literacy rates in Latin America are among the indigenous Quechua speakers in Peru.

Poverty is also highly correlated with the lack of opportunities for employment. The limited network of rural roads in Peru has isolated rural communities and the poor living in remote areas, severely limiting their opportunities for accessing markets, jobs, and socioeconomic services. Growing numbers of men have pursued seasonal labor in urban areas and refuge from armed conflicts.

At the same time, increasing numbers of children have attended school rather than participating in agriculture. The percentage of females enrolled is near parity at the primary level (at 98 percent) but decreases significantly at the secondary (69 percent) and tertiary levels (34 percent). Domestic violence is widespread; 47 percent of the women reported that they had experienced violence at least once. In rural areas, 65 percent of women and 70 percent in the Sierra had experienced violence.

The Government of Peru takes the view that gender equity is a strategic approach to overcome poverty and exclusion in the country. Under the guidance of the Ministry of Women and Social Development (MIMDES), the Government has aimed to advance gender equity by applying the Equal Opportunity Plan initiated in 2000, and updating it for 2006-2010.

**Project Development Objective:** to improve the access of the rural poor to basic social services, market integrating infrastructure, and income-generating activities with gender equity to help alleviate rural poverty and raise the living standards of rural communities.

#### Commitment:

Total: US \$151.21 million; World Bank: US \$50 million; IADB: US \$50 million; Government of Peru: US \$51.21 million.

## **Project components**

1. Rehabilitation and maintenance of rural roads and rural connecting roads
2. Improvement of non-motorized rural transport (tracks)
3. Development of community-based microenterprises for road maintenance development
4. Improvement of rural road planning and management
5. Strengthening local capacity to engage in social and development initiatives (Local Development Window)
6. Provincial road management pilot
7. River transport improvement pilot
8. Improvement of rural transport development policy and strategies

## **Project results**

- Increased income and household food security from road work and other microenterprise initiatives for both women and men.
- Women's and men's travel time was reduced by up to one half.
- Women's multitasking burdens were significantly reduced from the rehabilitation of non-motorized tracks, which reduced the opportunity cost of their time and increased their productivity and mobility choices.
- Cleaner, safer tracks also encouraged women to travel to sell agricultural products, deliver their babies in health centers, and participate in community meetings. Seventy-seven percent of the women surveyed said they traveled more; sixty-seven percent said they felt they traveled more safely. Girls' access to primary education increased by seven percent.
- One hundred community organizations engaged in local development activities and five hundred microenterprises performed routine maintenance on roads. This created 6,000 one-year-equivalent unskilled jobs, twenty-four percent of which were held by women.

## **Approaches that Worked**

### ***New Demand-Driven, Integrated Approach***

Through a learning process over ten years, the Peru Rural Roads Project established a new, inclusive, demand-driven approach for transport planning and economic development. Key elements included:

- Participatory, inclusive project design and implementation.
- Gender strategy informing project activities.
- The design of interconnected, complementary components (rural road rehabilitation and maintenance through local microenterprises, the local development window, and local governance capacity).
- Gender-sensitive monitoring and evaluation that informed other projects' design and management.

### ***Creation of a structure in the implementing agency to address gender issues***

A central gender coordinator and gender focal points in district offices were incorporated into the organizational structure. A gender training program for managers and field staff was developed. The gender team identified barriers to women's involvement in microenterprises for road maintenance and approaches to overcome them through community outreach and gender awareness training. Gender equity was part of Provias' (the project implementing agency) policy which also included working with women's organizations in the consultations and trainings.

### ***Separate community consultations for women and men in villages***

Separate consultations ensured that women were able to talk freely about transport needs and constraints. In response to local needs, particularly women's, the project rehabilitated 3,465 kilometers of non-motorized transport tracks which women use much more than men. These tracks proved to have a greater impact on economic growth than the roads, in part because they connected previously isolated communities with markets.

### ***Inclusion of women in road maintenance***

Qualifications for jobs were modified in the project operations manual by recognizing women's agricultural experience, roles as household managers, and leaders of women's organizations. The literacy requirement was dropped. Gender awareness and an emphasis on quality of work were incorporated into training for road maintenance. While the participation of women was resisted at first, the project prompted social change.

### ***Inclusion of women in the Local Development Window (LDW)***

LDW served as a coordination model that facilitated decentralization. It matches prospective entrepreneurs with funding sources. Thus it established a decision-making mechanism from the bottom-up that stimulated the empowerment of local male and female producers to decide their own future.

The LDW developed a rapid rural assessment to help insure the inclusiveness of the participatory process, particularly for women. The LDW took into account women's needs which resulted in strong participation of women in identification and implementation of entrepreneurial activities, such as the fish farming enterprise.

### ***Inclusive strengthening of local governance***

Local road institutes worked with municipalities to develop strategies for road rehabilitation. Road committees approved the roads and tracks for rehabilitation, assigned tasks, paid wages, and organized the contribution of labor. The project required twenty percent women members for road committees.

### ***Gender-sensitive monitoring and evaluation***

The project implementing agency became a learning organization based on performance monitoring and evaluation. A social and economic impact monitoring system tracked the gender-differentiated outcomes and took into account how different local realities might affect women's participation in project activities. The baseline studies and the impact evaluation sex disaggregated beneficiary data. The impact evaluation used the "double-difference" methodology. For

each road segment improved under the program, a “control road segment” sharing similar characteristics but outside of the project intervention area was selected. Households living nearby the improved and control road segments were then surveyed. The survey questionnaire tried to capture households’ socioeconomic characteristics, human capital, and productive activities, as well as the availability of social and economic infrastructure, access to public and private services, and presence of key State programs.

Rural households and local stakeholders (mostly local leaders) were also surveyed to assess their perception of the program and how this perception evolved over time. A qualitative gender impact assessment was conducted near the completion of the project in 2007.

### **Value Added by Women’s Participation**

- Women provided pragmatic inputs into project design, such as the request for rehabilitation of tracks which had more impact on poverty alleviation than on the road rehabilitation itself.
- Women’s participation increased the efficiency, quality, and transparency of road maintenance microenterprises. Women became watchdogs for the administration and improvement of rural roads. Women had more concern for transparency in money management and efficient use of resources and, many times, they were assigned treasury responsibilities (42 percent of female entrepreneurs were treasurers). In addition, some women were in charge of bringing the work certificates to local government for payment. Before showing these certificates, women also ensured that the quality of the work was up to the agreed technical standards.
- Women were more trusted because they were viewed as “incorruptible.” They were also more reliable in managing income because they were more transparent in accounts management and viewed corrupt practices more negatively than men. They were more effective at negotiating payments and trusted to ensure that the quality of the work met the agreed technical standards.
- Twenty-four percent of the members of Rural Roads Committees were women; women served as treasurers in forty-two percent of the road committees.
- Women gained trust among their male colleagues by doing a reliable job in managing funds. They gained respect by motivating the team to achieve quality in road maintenance. Men stopped drinking during road work and took fewer breaks.

### **Scaling up and Adaptation**

The approach and training materials used for recruiting and training women as well as men for road maintenance microenterprises in Peru have been incorporated in a toolkit (in Spanish) for the Latin America and the Caribbean Region. The training and outreach approach was also adapted for use in China and Honduras to increase community participation in road maintenance, particularly of women. The International Labor Office is planning to develop a gender-responsive toolkit in this area as well.

---

*Sources:* Cabellero, Luz and Merida Alcxahusi. 2007. Gender in Peru: Can Women be Integrated into Transport Projects. En Breve. Analytical Note Series 112. World Bank Latin American and Caribbean Region; Clarke, Mari. 2008. Innovation Activity Profile:Peru Rural Roads. Gender and Agriculture Sourcebook. World Bank, FAO, and IFAD. Hall, Gillette and Harry Patinos. 2010. Indigenous People, Poverty and Development. Draft report prepared for the WorldBank. Personal Communication, Maria Gutierrez, ILO.

## Good Practice Case: Bangladesh Second Rural Roads and Markets Improvement and Maintenance Project (1996 to 2003)

### Country Context

In 1995 the population of Bangladesh was 80 percent rural. The agriculture sector engaged roughly 69 percent of the overall workforce and generated about 33 percent of GDP. In a predominantly rural economy, rural infrastructure plays a vital role in supporting economic growth. However, prior to the implementation of this project, connectivity was poor because the rural roads, river jetties and markets in Bangladesh were in poor condition. Many were unpaved with no drainage and as a result were not passable during the rainy seasons. Transport demand grew much faster than the GDP. Non-motorized modes of transport predominated (e.g. rickshaws, animal-drawn carts, and country boats). The Government of Bangladesh had developed a ten-year Strategy for Rural Development (1985-1995) focusing resources on growth centers in rural areas with maximum potential. This informed the Rural Infrastructure Strategy aimed at improving and constructing feeder roads connecting growth centers and villages, drainage structures, and rural markets. The rural development strategy was extended for another decade through the Perspective Development Plan for the Country (1995-2010). Special emphasis was given to use of labor intensive technology wherever possible, targeting the poor for income generating opportunities to reduce poverty.

In the 1980s, there were many barriers to women's economic participation and voice in local governance. Social constraints on women's mobility prevented women from going to market, using public transportation, or engaging in income generating activities. Women had 13 percent literacy compared with almost 30 percent overall. In 2003, women's literacy stood at 32 percent compared with 54 percent of men's. An estimated 15 percent of the households were headed by women and 95 percent of those households lived in poverty. Due to social norms widows and divorcees had limited economic opportunities. Women receiving microcredit for businesses had no option other than buying inputs and selling products to middlemen, which left negligible profits for their labor. Women workers received 50 percent of the wages received by men.

Female poverty continues to be a problem. With a large part of the population living in rural areas, most poverty is rural; hence increasing access to rural infrastructure can have a significant impact on poverty, particularly for women and the poorest of the poor. A social and gender assessment by the government, with assistance from the World Bank, included consultations with village women, women leaders of local government, NGOs, and women's organizations. This revealed a demand for mechanisms for women's access to labor and product markets, equal wages, participation, and decision-making.

### Project Development Objectives

The project's objective is to help increase rural employment and incomes and reduce rural poverty by establishing an improved sustainable rural transport and trading infrastructure. Specifically:

- Help remove physical bottlenecks, improve quality, and reduce costs in rural transport and marketing.
- Create employment and income generating opportunities among the rural poor, particularly for disadvantaged women.
- Promote participation of local communities and NGOs in project activities.
- Increase institutional capacity for efficient rural infrastructure management, including maintenance.

## Commitment

World Bank: \$153 million

## Project Components

1. Improvement and upgrading of about 575 km of feeder roads Type B (FRBs) in the Project Area (14 districts in the Northwest and Greater Dhaka areas), with small bridges, culverts and tree planting alongside the roads. It also included bridges and culverts on other FRB roads not selected for full improvement and road safety improvements.
2. Establishment and implementation of a planned, routine, periodic maintenance system for the LGED (Local Government Engineering Department) road network in the project area covering all FRB roads, important RR1 roads, and structures on rural roads for replication nationally in the following years.
3. Construction of about 6000 culverts and small bridges (about 31,600 linear meters) of drainage structures on existing rural roads (mainly RR1 & RR2) (Nationwide), together with ancillary earthworks, to fill existing gaps on about 10,500 km of rural roads and make them passable year-round, and also correct drainage problems created by existing rural roads. This component emphasized local participation, use of labor-intensive technologies, and employment of landless poor and disadvantaged women.
4. Improvement of rural markets (i.e., raised and covered sales platforms, walkways, drainage, potable water supply, sanitation) in about 136 growth center markets (GCMs) in the project area, and improvement of about 14 UP center markets in the project area.
5. Rehabilitation/construction of 41 priority river jetties, or river '*ghats*', in the project area, to improve landing/unloading facilities for country boats.
6. Pilot program to improve safety and efficiency of non-motorized transport (NMT), particularly rickshaw vans and passenger rickshaws, which are extensively used in the country in the movement of goods and passengers in rural areas, with participation of appropriate NGOs.
7. Supply of equipment for road construction and maintenance, of vehicles for supervision of works, and of office and training equipment.
8. Institutional and human resources development for increasing and strengthening managerial and technical capacity of LGED, local Government agencies, and the local construction industry, including support for fiscal and technical audits.
9. Implementation support including technical assistance for the design, supervision, monitoring and evaluation of annual work programs, and support for a follow-up rural infrastructure project preparation.

## Project Results

One of the goals of the project was to create employment and income-generating opportunities among the rural poor, particularly for disadvantaged women. According to the Implementation Completion Report, the achievement of this objective was highly satisfactory. In the project area, the construction and maintenance of roads, structures, and markets have created both long-term and short-term employment and income generating opportunities for the rural poor in general and the destitute women in particular.

- A total of 78,000 person-years of employment have been created by the civil construction and maintenance, 25 percent of which went to females.

- About 5,700 maintenance crew members for both on-pavement and off-pavement maintenance are engaged throughout the year.
- An estimated 13,000 destitute women are also currently employed by the LGED, outside the project area, throughout the year for off-pavement maintenance.
- Overall there was a 50 percent increase in women's employment.
- Due to the introduction of mobile maintenance by the Project and subsequent replication of the same in all non-project districts, about 6,600 maintenance laborers are now working for on-pavement maintenance throughout the year.
- In the growth center markets, about 500 women have been provided with shops in the women's corners.
- Land-poor workers diversified their employment opportunities in non-agricultural activities, such as transport, trade and services.
- Institutional and policy level support for women traders increased.
- Women's voice increased in local decision-making and governance.

## **Approaches that Worked**

### ***Recruitment of poor women for road work***

In order to recruit people for the road maintenance and tree planting component, loudspeaker announcements were made along the roads that were targeted for improvement. This enabled reaching and employing the poor who lived there. Labor intensive methods of building and maintenance were used where possible to maximize the number of destitute and poor who could be employed by the project and in its maintenance later. Targets were set requiring the allocation of 30 percent of the road construction jobs and 100 percent of the tree planting and maintenance work to women.

### ***Women's sections in markets***

Adding women's sections to the markets enabled the inclusion of both women vendors and women buyers, which had not been possible previously. Targets required allocation of 30 percent of the shops and 30 percent of the market management committee positions to women. Women entrepreneurs were able to buy and sell products themselves, eliminating the middle men and thus increasing their profits.

***Formation of women's trade associations, contracting societies, self help groups, and rotating loan groups*** These groups gave women bargaining power and provided savings and rotating loans. Women's microenterprises for road rehabilitation and maintenance and tree planting were also formed. Women were able to increase their income and assets in a sustainable manner. In one market, nearly 90 percent of the shops were owned by women.

### ***Partnerships between local government institutions and civil society organizations***

Local government partnered with NGOs and microfinance institutions for social mobilization, group formation and microfinance services. Local government recruited women mobilizers, social scientists, gender specialists and women engineers and established a local government gender forum providing advocacy, training and monitoring. Women's voice in decision-making and local governance increased.



### ***Gender-sensitive infrastructure design***

Consultations with women revealed the need for separate toilet facilities and separate rooms for women in the flood refuges, waiting areas for boats on the river jetties (*ghats*), and markets.

### ***Ongoing gender-responsive monitoring***

Qualitative analysis was conducted with men and women throughout the project implementation to assess their satisfaction with the way in which the project was being run.

### **Value Added by Women's Participation**

- Consultations with village women, women leaders, and NGOs revealed a demand for mechanisms to provide women access to income earning opportunities, equal wages, and community decision-making which informed the project design and contributed significantly to the successful project outcomes as well as their sustainability. Women's organizations mobilized support and women's labor and entrepreneurship contributed to poverty reduction and increased school enrollment, particularly for girls.
- The employment of women in road maintenance and the decision to use labor intensive methods in order to employ the maximum number of women possible led to the addition of tree planting and maintenance. Not only did the planting and maintenance of trees along the roads provide additional labor hours, but they also contributed to the reduction of soil erosion, increasing the value of the land around them.
- Consultations with women improved the design of infrastructure. Installation of women's restroom facilities at the market sites made it easier and more socially acceptable for women to spend time at the markets, both as vendors and consumers.

### **Scale-up and Adaptation**

RRMIMP II was a follow on project from RRMIM initiated in 1988. Gender mainstreaming was introduced in that project and refined in RRMIMP II. An ongoing project, the Rural Transport Improvement Project, began in 2003 at the same time that RRMIMP II closed. RTIP aims to further refine the participatory process and gender mainstreaming of the former projects through the mainstreaming of a Mobile Routine Maintenance System (MRMS) that employs additional destitute women and targets women traders for spaces in markets. Additionally, ADB has implemented a Third Rural Infrastructure Development Project, with a high gender focus.

---

*Sources:* World Bank: 1996a, Staff Appraisal Report. 1996. B. Memorandum and Recommendation of the President of the International Development Association to the Executive Directors on a Proposed Credit to the People's Republic of Bangladesh for a Second Rural Roads and Markets Improvement and Maintenance Project. 2003, Implementation and Completion Report. Anders Rundqvist: 2001, Report on Participatory Planning for RRMIMP II, Nilufar Ahmad 2007. Women's Empowerment through Rural Transport and Markets. World Bank.

## Good Practice Case: Mumbai Urban Transport Project Resettlement (FY2002-2009)

### Country Context

Mumbai is the largest metropolitan region in India and one of the largest, most crowded, and complex urban settings in the world. Some eighteen million people live in an area of 1,467 sq. km. This is expected to grow to 22 million by 2011. As the commercial and financial center of the country, the city generates about five percent of the national GDP and contributes over one-third of the country's tax revenues. The urban transport network is linear in a North-South direction. Two suburban rail services and three arterial roads are the backbones of the metropolitan region transport system. Most of the streets in the city are old and narrow, and their capacity is seriously reduced by lack of appropriate management of traffic and parking. Traffic congestion worsens each day, largely due to this poor management. Air pollution tends to rise, as inspection and enforcement of standards remain inadequate. The poor are most impacted because they are the least protected, having to deal with uncertain incomes and insecure settlements in which they live. The risk of traffic accidents is also growing.

Public transport plays a dominant role in the urban economy of Mumbai. Rail and bus services combined carry 88 percent of the region's motorized personal trips. Buses carry over 4.5 million passengers per day, 60 percent of whom transfer to rail. Rail passengers suffer from some of the most severe overcrowding in the world. Nine car trains, with a capacity of 1,800 passengers, carry over 4,000 passengers – 11 persons per square meter. Overcrowding is so severe that passengers are often seen hanging on the outside of the open coaches (without doors). Over five deaths are reported on Mumbai Railway tracks daily. Before the Mumbai Urban Transport Project was implemented, squatter settlements and trespassers encroached on the right-of-way safety zone, reducing the speed of trains, increasing travel time, and hampering maintenance work.

Almost every infrastructure improvement activity in Mumbai involves acquisition of land and relocation of people, primarily squatters, from their informal dwellings and livelihoods. Mumbai is one of the few Indian cities which has had in place its own legislation to plan and implement slum rehabilitation schemes since the 1970s. The policy and practice of urban resettlement has evolved over years in Mumbai; however, the problem of dealing with slums has persisted with some 6.5 million people still living in informal settlements without any recognized land tenure. Weak land use enforcement, ineffective implementation of rehabilitation schemes, intense demographic pressures and local political economy factors explain the challenges facing urban development in Mumbai. Lack of consultations with and poor involvement of affected persons in planning and implementing resettlement and livelihood restoration have been often cited as key factors in past failures. However, this situation has been slowly changing.

Mumbai remains one of the more women-friendly cities in India, where millions of women travel everyday to work by public transport. Compared to the patriarchal Northern parts of India, Mumbai is perhaps a safer place for women. However, women struggle as much in Mumbai as their counterparts anywhere else in a big city for survival every day. The plight of women in informal settlements is worse. In the squatter settlements both women and men have limited access to potable water, toilets, sewage and electricity. The negative impact on women is more severe given their economic role combined with their domestic responsibilities. On the brighter side, the presence of vibrant civil society organizations has enabled women to play an active role in the public sphere and participate in community activities in the squatter settlements.

## **Project Development Objective**

To facilitate urban economic growth and improve quality of life by fostering the development of an efficient and sustainable urban transport system including effective institutions to meet the needs of the users in the metropolitan area.

## **Commitment**

World Bank: \$463 million

## **Project Components**

- 1) Rail transport – improving the capacity and performance of the suburban rail system through service efficiency improvements, new rolling stock, and expanding network capacity.
- 2) Road-based transport – increase in the capacity, efficiency and safety of the road network, better facilities for pedestrians, improvement in efficiency and quality of bus services, and reduction in motor vehicle emissions.
- 3) Resettlement and rehabilitation – enable the municipal government to undertake the timely implementation of the Resettlement Action Plan for assistance to persons affected by the rail and road based transport components and assist those displaced to improve their living standards. This includes construction of houses and shops and reconstruction of civic amenities as well as compensation for permanent loss of livelihoods and greater distance to the workplace.

## **Approaches that Worked**

### ***Requirement for relocation and resettlement policy***

In preparing the Mumbai Urban Transport Program (MUTP), the World Bank enabled the Government of Maharashtra to formulate a state level urban resettlement and rehabilitation policy, which provided for relocation of all the households affected by the project undertaken in public interest to permanent buildings with secure tenure.

### ***Government partnerships with civil society and community organizations***

The Mumbai Metropolitan Regional Development Authority (MMRDA) established working relationships with civil society organizations including women's association (Mahila Milan), National Slum City Dwellers Foundation (NSDF), and Slum Resettlement Society for the orderly resettlement of over 60,000 people using a strong participatory process and community mobilization.

### ***Survey of affected persons to assess and disclose entitlements***

As preliminary work, the affected households were surveyed with socioeconomic data and information on likely losses recorded in order to assess and disclose resettlement and rehabilitation entitlements so that the project-affected households understood what they were entitled to following relocation. The resettlement plans ensured that resettled women could continue their support systems and economic activities.

### ***Titling of settlement properties to both husbands and wives***

Another important aspect of the resettlement plan included joint titling of final resettlement properties to both husbands and wives. This has given women more security in their new residences.

### ***Financial and other assistance to affected persons***

The project provided all the resettled households with maintenance and management grants so that they could manage their new buildings and assets on a sustainable basis. MMRDA hired the services of a consultant to provide the resettled households with post-resettlement support in the form of capacity building, housing society registration, leadership building, governance, and financial management of their assets. The NGOs also promoted community policing which worked well in certain resettlement townships.

### ***Livelihoods Enhancement Plan (LEAP)***

MMRDA has set up a livelihoods cell and is implementing a livelihoods enhancement action plan (LEAP) for the resettled women in order to strengthen their incomes. In order to make the resettlement process truly sustainable, MMRDA has instituted a separate department for providing post-resettlement support to the relocated communities. It is expected that with sustained and strategic involvement, the newly established in the resettlement townships will be in a position to more sustainably manage their own affairs, in which the women will increasingly play a more effective role.

### ***From a prescriptive approach to a win-win negotiated approach***

The Government of Maharashtra adopted a set of alternative resettlement solutions for shopkeepers, but in many cases went beyond these alternatives to negotiate with shopkeepers for innovative resettlement; this entailed numerous dialogues and consultations, and succeeded due to the problem solving approach adopted by the government. This approach also worked in relocating religious structures.

### ***Independent mechanism for oversight mediation***

The Independent Monitoring Panel constituted to monitor the project played a crucial role in enhancing the quality of the resettlement process and outcomes through regular field visits and stock taking. The independent grievance redress mechanisms also played an effective role in dealing with people's grievances. Overall, this enhanced credibility of the project.

### ***Value Added by Women's Participation***

*Mahila Milan*, a women's organization targeting low income communities, played a vital role in promoting micro-credit activities among about 10,000 resettled women. *Mahila Milan* also established food banks providing provisions at wholesale cost and initiated a nursery for children to enable their mothers to earn income. A *Mahila Milan* committee also organized pest control and crime prevention. The post resettlement support program played a big role in promoting women's income generation and management of their housing society assets and funds. Women also have started to play a larger role in environmental management in the resettlement townships. MMRDA formed a women's industrial cooperative called SANKALP (resolve) which started micro-credit and micro-enterprise activities on a significant scale within a limited time.

---

*Sources:* Mishra, Satya. 2009. Presentation on Mumbai Urban Transport, World Bank, 2010 personal communication; Dickson, Eric. nd. Community Participation in Resettlement: An Alternative to Evictions. London School of Economics and Political Science; World Bank 2002. Project Appraisal Document, Mumbai Urban Transport. World Bank 2002. Project Appraisal Document, Mumbai Urban Transport.

## Good Practice Case: Liaoning China Urban Transport Project (FY2007-2012)

### Country Context

Urban Transport in the medium cities of Liaoning province in northeast China presents a combination of challenges particular to their historic and recent economic context. While China has become an international symbol of economic growth and poverty alleviation in the last three decades, the medium cities in Liaoning have benefited only to a limited extent from this period of prosperity. As one of China's most urbanized regions (with 53 percent urban population in 2003), Liaoning used to be one of the country's major industrial centers, with its economies anchored around a small number of state-owned industrial and mining enterprises. Such enterprises have had mixed success in the transition to a market economy, and have generally found themselves under severe financial pressure. This has weakened the economic base of the cities. As a result, the road and public transport systems in the medium cities of Liaoning have suffered from systemic fiscal neglect, leading into a serious deterioration of the asset base and under provision of basic transportation services. These cities need systematic maintenance, rehabilitation and management of the transport network, including secondary roads and pedestrian walkways, and related services.

Despite the tremendous need for transportation system maintenance and service improvements, in Liaoning, as elsewhere in China, the municipal transport planning and management processes have too often produced large high-profile transport investments with disproportionate focus on the needs of the users of motorized vehicles and minimal attention to the needs of users of alternative modes such as bicycles, rickshaws, and walking. The most vulnerable are left with inadequate levels of basic services and safety. Additionally, transport planning practices have not been effective in identifying citizen's priorities. Although public consultation is required as part of the environmental impact review process, such efforts normally occur after investment decisions have been made and focus on impact mitigation. This leaves little room for residents to influence decisions on what will be built. As a result, the vulnerable are often an afterthought in urban infrastructure design. Much can be done to make the transport planning and management processes in Liaoning's medium cities more responsive to the national government's "People First" development strategy and the desire to create a socially harmonious society.

Although China's laws on gender equality are exemplary, 50 years of advocacy of gender equality have not transformed deep underlying cultural beliefs about gender roles, reflected in the skewed demographics of more males than females because most parents prefer boys. Males carry on the family name, care for parents in old age, and perform funeral rituals. For many, females are seen as weaker, inferior and not doing important things. There has been a feminization of poverty in rural and urban areas. With market liberalization, there is increasing gender inequality in the labor market reflected in income gaps and gender bias in hiring and firing. Women bore a disproportionate share of layoffs in Liaoning Province; 62% of the people laid off were women. Women also have less access to credit. Domestic violence is also widespread in China; 25 percent of the urban women reported occasional to repeated physical abuse from spouses.

This project supports a broad-based participation process during design and implementation to inform and influence local government decision-making on issues related to transport. A special outreach effort was made as part of this participatory process to understand and address the concerns of different vulnerable groups, including women, the elderly, and people with disabilities.

## **Project Development Objective**

To assist the Borrower's Project Cities in enhancing:

- The performance and quality of their existing urban transport infrastructure in terms of mobility, access, and safety
- The efficiency and effectiveness of their urban public transport and road maintenance services
- The responsiveness of their urban transport systems to the needs of population without access to private motorized vehicles

## **Bank Commitment**

US \$218million IBRD loan out of a US \$525million overall estimated project cost

## **Project Components**

The project covers the center cities of Panjin, Jinzhou, Fushun, Benxi, and Liaoyang municipalities, and the county town of Dengta in Liaoyang municipality. It has been designed to reverse the deterioration of the asset base, improve the "livability" and investment climate, and support initiatives that reflect national and provincial priorities related to urban transport. The design has been refined through extensive user group consultations. The project has five components in each city:

- Road Infrastructure and Reconstruction: improvements in the primary, secondary and tertiary networks to address current transport problems and bottlenecks;
- Secondary Road Rehabilitation and Road Maintenance Equipment: rehabilitation to improve last-mile access to pedestrians and bicyclists, and financing of road maintenance equipment;
- Traffic Safety and Traffic Management: support for the implementation of the National Road Safety Law (NRSL) through enhanced traffic management, monitoring and traffic control systems to improve safety and traffic flow.
- Public Transport: provision of bus priority facilities and improvements in public transport planning and operations in the project cities;
- Institutional Development: technical assistance (TA) in transport planning and management, reform in road maintenance practices and in the structure of the public transport industry, and project management assistance.

## **Approaches That Worked:**

### ***Public participation***

Instrumental to the design and scope of the project was an extensive public participation process in all project cities to supplement the technical planning analyses. The goal was to understand the key urban transport concerns of the citizens and provide an opportunity for their input into the project design.

International experience suggests that in the realm of urban transport, a public participation process can be a valuable complement to the technical planning process in generating effective projects with widespread distributional benefits that minimize adverse impacts. In Liaoning, the participatory process was used to avoid potential “bad” decisions and improve project design based on a better understanding of various citizens’ priorities. It was also one of the first participatory efforts officially funded by the government.

### ***Extensive participatory assessment of transport needs***

Carried out in three phases (during project preparation, appraisal and implementation stages) people’s concerns and priorities were gathered through open meetings, focus groups, interviews, and quantitative surveys. The participation of political leaders, city planners, vulnerable groups, and different mode users in this exercise was pivotal in identifying the needs of groups which are often overlooked, such as non-auto users, migrants, the disabled, and the unemployed.

### ***Use of assessment findings for awareness raising for public officials***

The public participation exercises effectively raised city leaders’ sensitivity to the public’s needs and led to the modification of the project’s original objectives. Through focusing on the needs and concerns of project impacted residents, investment emphases were turned away from large infrastructure investments (ring roads, major arterials, and road widening schemes) towards incremental solutions centered on benefiting pedestrians and cyclists (local road network improvement, safety enhancements, and basic infrastructure development).

### ***Separate male and female focus group discussions***

The process was also designed to be gender sensitive. Women-only focus groups were conducted to involve female project beneficiaries. Special attention to gender issues in the process helped identify important latent transportation needs and concerns. Women, much more than men, raised concerns about safety and personal security related to the lack of street lighting and poorly designed underpasses. For female public transport users, the long waits for buses, combined with the location, design, and poor facilities at bus stops, contributed to women’s transport vulnerability. A key finding was that for many women, the lack of evening (off-peak) bus services, combined with poor street lighting, created barriers to their access to employment opportunities.

### **Value Added by Women’s Participation**

In response to the concerns raised primarily by women, the project has included: significant upgrading and new construction of urban road networks including street lighting; reviews of the bus networks as a prelude to possible restructuring and reorganization; and the development of a systematic program, based on annual monitoring of results, to improve traffic safety in the project cities.

### **Scale Up and Adaptation of Good Practice**

For some time the Bank has been working together with various clients in China to identify ways to effectively introduce public participation in the infrastructure planning and implementation process. The successful outcomes of Liaoning’s participation efforts have been well recognized within the Bank and among Bank clients in other Chinese cities. This has led to the replication of similar exercises in other ongoing Bank-funded urban transport projects in

China. What was once disregarded or considered non-essential in urban transport infrastructure investments is now an integral part of Bank-financed projects in China.

The participation of residents and vulnerable groups in identifying infrastructure needs has become an important tool for project officials and city leaders. Project officials in Benxi, Panjin and Jinzhou have affirmed the value of public participation exercises because they have helped to ensure that projects deliver the maximum benefits to the greatest number of people, including vulnerable and other often excluded groups. In some cities, participatory efforts have been continued even after the World Bank's involvement officially ended. By being more aware of special needs and introducing some low or no-cost investments, the Chinese principle of "people first" for urban transport has been put into practice in Liaoning Province. It is hoped that the success case in Liaoning can be achieved elsewhere and not only in road infrastructure but also in other projects.

---

*Sources:* Chen, Wenling and Shomik Raj Mehndiratta. 2006. Lighting up her Way: Integrating Gender Issues in Urban Transport Project Design through Public Participation. A Case Study from Liaoning China. World Bank and 2010, detailed comments on the draft case study. Mehndiratta, Shomik. 2008. LightingUp her Way: Addressing Gender Concerns Using Public Participation Techniques. Presentation at Asia Pacific Regional Meeting on Gender Equality in Infrastructure Projects;World Bank, 2002. China Country Gender Review. East Asia Environment and Social Development Unit; 2006. Project Appraisal Document for Liaoning Medium Cities Transport Project.

## Good Practices: Building Social and Gender Capacity of Implementing Agencies

Building the social and gender capacity of client implementing agencies is essential to ensure the sustainability of gender and transport initiatives within projects. The good practice examples below illustrate different approaches taken in Ethiopia, Bangladesh and Peru.

### **Training on the Social Dimensions of Transport in Ethiopia**

The Ethiopian Roads Authority (ERA) did not have appropriate experience or training to conduct baseline studies or address HIV/AIDS and other social issues. An Environmental Monitoring Safety Branch was established to fill this gap. Staff included an engineer, an ecologist, a geologist, two sociologists and two HIV/AIDS prevention specialists. ERA trained and sensitized the contractors and consulted on social issues including gender and HIV/AIDS. The World Bank facilitated training for transport staff and contractors on the social dimensions of transport. The training created awareness of the importance gender and other social issues and built capacity among local social scientists and transport authorities to identify these issues and address them in the work of the Ethiopian Roads Authority. It also helped create a constituency of advocates for the issues.

---

*Source:* Riverson, John,et.al.. 2005. Challenges in Addressing Gender Dimensions of Transport in Developing Countries: Lessons from World Bank Projects.



## **Mainstreaming Gender in the Bangladesh Local Government Engineering Department (LGED)**

LGED provides technical support to rural and urban local government institutions as well as rural and urban infrastructure development projects. In the 1990s, LGED managers recognized the importance of going beyond the technicalities of infrastructure construction to address the needs of infrastructure users. The gender specialist in the Asian Development Bank Resident Mission worked with LGED on gender entry points for its projects. By 2000 the first gender action plan was developed for the Third Rural Infrastructure Project.

ADB provided training-of-trainers courses on gender and development for LGED senior officials in 2000 and for senior officers, including project directors, in 2002. A training manual was developed and gender training was institutionalized for project staff.

Based on an assessment of attention to gender issues in LGED projects, an agency gender mainstreaming strategy was developed for 2002-2007, with support from the Embassy of the Netherlands. LGED project directors and other team members attended ADB workshop on gender mainstreaming in specific subsectors. In 2007, LGED conducted its own internal review of progress on its gender action plan and developed a new gender action plan through 2015. In a 2007 workshop, it was agreed that all projects must have gender and development components with monitoring mechanisms set out in gender action plans. In project design, each component must be analyzed to identify ways to involve women.

Recognizing that engineers did not have all the necessary skills to address infrastructure user needs, LGED created positions for a sociologist and a community organizer. Commitment to gender and social dimensions is now endorsed through a monthly high level committee at LGED involving 15 ministries. Project directors are accountable for progress through regular monitoring reports to the committee.

---

*Source:* ADB. 2009. Institutionalizing Gender Equality: the Experience of the Bangladesh Resident Mission. Manila.

## **Second Peru Rural Roads Project**

In the Second Peru Rural Roads Project, *Provias* -- the implementing organization-- created a structure to ensure that women participated and benefited from the projects. This included a central gender coordinator and gender focal points in district offices. Under the guidance of the Peruvian gender consultant, a gender training program for managers and field staff was designed and implemented. The gender team also evaluated barriers to women's involvement in microenterprises for road maintenance and developed and monitored gender related indicators throughout the project cycle. Gender equity was part of the implementing agency's policy. Women were invited to participate in consultations and training on rehabilitation of and maintenance of roads and tracks. A Peruvian gender consultant was hired to guide the institutionalization of gender in the agency's operations.

---

*Source:* Caballero, Lutz, and Nerida Alcahuasi. 2007. Gender in Peru: Can Women Be Integrated into Transport Projects? En Breve. Analytical Note Series No. 112., World Bank

## Highlights of Innovative Approaches to Gender in Transport Projects

### **Honduras Road Reconstruction and Improvement Project (FY2008-2013)**

The project aims to provide improved all-season access within agriculturally productive zones and improve living conditions and quality of life for the participating communities. As the project has received GAP funding, a Gender Action Plan has been formulated for this project to inform implementing agency policy and to identify gender champions within the agency. Workshops will be conducted to understand women's constraints and opportunities for participation. In addition, a gender balanced approach will be utilized to ensure that women as well as men have access to the opportunities generated through this program. The micro-enterprises program is expected to generate about 200 direct employment opportunities and cover about 380 km of roads. The micro-enterprise program for road maintenance consists of 70 micro-enterprises, 36 of them financed by the World Bank through the end of 2006. The purpose of such enterprises is to provide consistent and permanent maintenance to the roads in Honduras. Women represent less than 2 percent of the micro-enterprise labor force and they perform the same work tasks as men. The project has set a target of at least 10 percent females in the micro-enterprise labor force. The micro-enterprise program requires that employers avoid discrimination against women in hiring laborers. These employers also asked to promote mutual respect in the work environment, and in particular, respect for women working in mixed-teams. Employees of the micro-enterprises receive a five month literacy training course. All members of the worker's family can participate in this training with no age restriction. Workers and their families also receive training in environmental issues. Women's income from work in micro-enterprises helps them pay for school costs for their children, who can now attend school. It has also enabled them to invest in remodeling their houses. An HIV/AIDS plan is being implemented to prevent the spread of the disease via the improved roadways; commercial sex workers and housewives have been identified as some of the vulnerable groups to be targeted.

---

Source: World Bank 2008, Project Appraisal for the Second Honduras Road Reconstruction and Improvement Project.

### **Lesotho: Integrated Transport Project, FY2007-2011**

The Lesotho Integrated Transport Project aims to reduce the isolation of Lesotho's citizens and improve their access to services and market opportunities through a more complete, safe and affordable transport system and more coordinated transport sector management. A GENFUND grant supported a pilot project of a participatory mapping that was incorporated into a geographic information system (GIS) used for local development planning. The GIS provided information on the transport services available to communities, access to health, education and other services as well as how women, men, children and the elderly used existing roads, paths, and services, and what bottlenecks existed. Community meetings, interviews and focus group discussions held in all communities provided information on differences in men's and women's priorities for transport project activities. For example, in one village, while women preferred the road under discussion to be constructed in one direction to facilitate their access to the nearest village with basic services, men preferred that the road be built in the opposite direction to enable them to reach the larger town and market more easily on horseback. Gender is also included in the monitoring and evaluation plan.

---

*Sources:* Walker et. al 2005, Ground Truthing: Mobility Mapping in Rural Lesotho, Ministry of Transport; World Bank 2006, Project Appraisal Document for Lesotho Integrated Transport Project.

### **Ethiopia Rural Road Sector Development Program (FY1998-FY2009)**

The objectives of the First Road Sector Development Program Support Project (FY1998-FY2005) were to contribute to Ethiopia's economic development by improving trunk and regional rural road access and utilization to meet the agricultural and other economic development needs; building up the institutional capacity in both the public and private sectors for sustainable road development and maintenance; and providing economic opportunity for the rural poor both through increased employment in rural road works. A village level transport and travel study in 1999 was conducted in preparation for the Ethiopian Rural Travel and Transport Program, a component of the Rural Road Sector Development Program. The study revealed that women spent three times as much effort on travel and transport tasks and twice as much time on household related travel (collecting fuel, water and food) which took up to 20 to 25 percent of adult women's working time. None of the households in the study area owned motor vehicles, carts or bicycles. Donkeys were the most widespread form of transport. Based on these surveys, transport planners aimed to reduce the transport burden by consulting with women and increasing their representation in transport planning and decision-making. They also used these findings to sensitize policy makers and local people about the gender aspects of transport.

The objective of the first phase of the Second Road Sector Development Project was to restore and expand Ethiopia's road network to reduce poverty and increase employment through promoting growth and access in a socially and environmentally sustainable manner. The project incorporated gender-responsive monitoring and evaluation. Local transport development studies conducted at the lowest local government level (*Wereda*) used a participatory approach to assess the socioeconomic environment, including gender issues, to guide interventions at the local level and inform policy at the regional and central level. To address high rates of maternal mortality associated with poor access to health professionals due to limited infrastructure, Ethiopia's transport agency is also planning innovative pilots, such as the introduction of emergency access cards, to enable the rapid transport of women in obstructed labor to the nearest capable health facility. Work with NGOs, the Red Cross, and technical schools will introduce intermediate means of transport to help transport emergency patients. Communities will receive tools for labor-based construction activities, including culvert and bridge construction and maintenance, to help ensure year-round access for emergency transport.

---

*Sources:* John, Mika Kunieda, Peter Roberts, Negede Lewi, and Wendy Walker. 2005. Challenges in Addressing Gender Dimensions of Transport in Developing Countries: Lessons from World Bank Projects; World Bank Nd. Case Study 8. Gender Mainstreaming: Rural Roads and the Transport Sector Module III. Integrating Gender into Transport Projects. World Bank Institute. 2009. Case Study: Transport: The World Bank's support of the Ethiopian Government's Road Sector Development Program

## 11. Gender and Transport Website Resources

**Global Transport Knowledge Partnership** Initiative sponsored by DFID to promote and disseminate sustainable transport knowledge relevant to developing and emerging countries. <http://www.gtkp.com/>.

**Gender and Transport Network (GATNET)** A virtual forum for mainstreaming gender into the transport sector. Website and email network for individuals interested in gender and transport, particularly in developing countries. [http://ifrtd.gn.apc.org/new/gender\\_gat/about.htm](http://ifrtd.gn.apc.org/new/gender_gat/about.htm).

**Gender and Transport Resource Guide** Extensive virtual library of resources on mainstreaming gender in transport, funded by the Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Policy Program (SSAT\_P. Provides summaries of rationale, opportunities, challenges, and good practices as well as training tools, conference materials, and technical reports. <http://www4.worldbank.org/afr/ssatp/Resources/HTML/Gender-RG/index.html>.

**Global Road Safety Partnership (GRSP)** Red Cross hosted global partnership of governments, civil society, and private sector for sustainable improvement of road safety in developing and transition countries. <http://www.grsproadsafety.org>.

**International Forum for Rural Transport and Development (IFRTD)** A global network of individuals and organizations working together toward improved access and mobility for the rural poor in developing countries. <http://ifrtd.gn.apc.org/>.

**International Labor Organization Gender Equality Tools** <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/gender.home>.

**International Labor Organization Advisory, Support Information Services and Training (ILO ASIST)** Mainstreaming poverty alleviation strategies through sustainable infrastructure development. <http://www.iloasist.org>.

**International Transport Workers Federation** The ITF Women's Committee and Department campaigns and responds to issues of discrimination and lack of opportunity for women in the industry. <http://www.itfglobal.org>

**Rural Transport KnowledgeBase** Sponsored by SSATP, the World Bank, and DFID. Includes latest thinking and practice on rural transport and increased rural mobility. <http://www.transport-links.org/rtkb/rtkb.htm>.

**Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Policy Program (SSATP)** A joint initiative of the World Bank and the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA) to facilitate policy development and related capacity building in the transport sector of Sub-Saharan Africa. A gender and transport thematic group was created in 2006. This site hosts the Gender and Transport Resource Guide. <http://www.worldbank.org/afr/ssatp>

**Sustainable Urban Transport Project (SUTP)**, led by German Technical Cooperation (GTZ), aims to help cities in developing countries achieve their sustainable transport goals, through the dissemination of information about international experience and targeted work with particular cities. <http://www.sutp.org>

**Transportation Research Board (TRB)** is a division of the US National Research Council and promotes innovation and progress in transportation through research. There is a TRB Committee on Women's Issues in Transport. <http://trb.org/>

**Waterways and Livelihoods** This website gathers international knowledge, research, and networking tools on rural water transport to help users influence policy and practice at the local, national, and international levels. <http://www.ruralwaterways.org>.

**World Bank Transport and Social Responsibility** Focus on inclusion in the transport sector regarding access, disability, age, and gender. <http://www.worldbank.org/responsibletransport>.

**World Bank Gender and Development** Provides sectoral and regional examples of good practice projects, global gender statistics, country gender assessments, and information on Gender Action Plan for project related gender research, pilots and monitoring and evaluation. <http://www.worldbank.org/gender>

**World Bank Social Development, Gender and Sustainable Development.** Gender and social dimensions of infrastructure projects, tools for task teams, case studies. <http://www.worldbank.org/socialdevelopment>

## 12. Suggested Reading on Gender and Transport

- Donnges, Chris. 2003. **"Improving Access in Rural Areas: Guidelines for Rural Accessibility Planning."** ILO, Geneva.
- Essakali, Mohamed Dalil. 2005. **Rural Access and Mobility in Pakistan: A Policy Note.** Transport Note 28. Roads, Highways and Rural Transport Thematic Group, the World Bank.
- International Forum for Rural Transport and Development (IFRTD). 2003. **Waterway Livelihoods: Improving Access and Mobility through Rural Development of Water Transport.** IFRTD website.
- Kunieda, Mika and Aimee Gautier. 2006. **Gender and Urban Transport: Smart and Affordable.** Module 7a. Sustainable Transport Sourcebook for Policy Makers in Developing Countries. GTZ. Revised in 2007.
- Litman, Todd. 2006. **Evaluating Transportation Equity.** Victoria Transport Policy Institute. March.
- Maramba, Petronella and Michael. Bamberger. 2001. **A Gender Responsive Monitoring and Evaluation System for Rural Travel and Transport Programs in Africa: A Handbook for Planners, Managers and Evaluators,** SSATP Working Paper No. 55.
- Montgomery, Brittany and Peter Roberts. 2008. Walk Urban. **Demand, constraints, and Measurement of the Urban Pedestrian Environment.** Transport Papers TP-18. Transport Sector Board, World Bank.
- Peters, Dieke, ND. **Designing a Gender Sensitive Bicycle Component,** Institute for Transport and Development Policy (ITDP). Gender and Transport Resource Guide Web site.
- Rankin, Elizabeth. 1999. Gender and Transport a Strategy for Africa . World Bank.
- ND. **Designing a Gender Sensitive Intermediate Means of Transport Component.** Gender and Transport Resource Guide Web site.
- Spitzner, Meike, Frank Weiler, Rahmad Andi and Jeff Turner. 2007. **Urban Mobility and Gender: Promoting the Regional Public Transport system in the Greater Jakarta Area.** KfW Entwicklungsbank Position Paper. August
- Starkey, Paul. 2001. **"Local Transport Solutions: People, Paradoxes and Progress: Lessons Arising from the Spread of Intermediate Means of Transport."** SSATP Working Paper 56, World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Starkey, Paul, Simon Ellis, John Hine, and Anna Ternell. 2003. **Improving Rural Mobility: Options for Developing Motorized and Non-Motorized Transport in Rural Areas.** World Bank Technical Paper 525
- Walker, Wendy, Shalini Vajjhala, Thasi Phomane, Nokulekeko Zaly, Senate Moonyane, and M. Mokhorro . 2005. **Ground Truthing: Mobility Mapping and Access in Rural Lesotho.** World Bank and Lesotho MoPW. April, 2005. World Bank. 2001.
- World Bank. 2006. **Social Analysis in Transport Projects: Guidelines for Incorporating Social Dimensions into Bank-Supported Projects.**
- 2009: **Transport Against HIV/AIDS: Synthesis of Experience and Best Practice Guidelines.** Transport Sector Board Paper 25.

2010 **Mainstreaming Gender in Road Transport, Operational Guidance for World Bank Staff.** Transport Sector Board Paper 28.